

**INSULTING THE WIVES OF THE
GOD'S MESSENGER**

Responding to the doubts

The scholar Hossein Ghazvini

Our discussion , in the last session was about the speech of one of the Wahhabitie leaders, named Othman Al-Khamis that ,according to his own word, has cast forty or fifty doubts on Shiism and he has put it up in different sites and they have printed and published some pamphlets which were taken from this speech in different countries. We also respond to some doubts in the last session and we will take into consideration the doubt which accuse the Shiite regarding the wives of the blessed Prophet (May peace upon him and his family) today, too.

They say that the fifth doubt which we have to ,the Shiite creed and the Shiite , respond is that the Shiite do not observe politeness to the wives of the blessed messenger (May peace upon him and his family).

There is a narration in Bahar Al-Anvar which has been narrated from the Commander of the believer (May peace upon him) that says:

I went on a trip with the blessed messenger (May peace upon him and his family) and Ayesheh also accompanied the blessed messenger (May peace upon him and his family) in that trip and I was the only one who served the blessed messenger (May peace upon him) and we did not have more than one comforter and the blessed messenger (May peace upon him) slept between Ayesheh and I. the blessed messenger (May peace upon him) woke up at dawn to say the night prayer and I was asleep and the blessed messenger (May peace upon him) came and put the comforter between Ayesheh and I as a distance-maker and he folded it to make this distance between Ayesheh and I safer. Othman Al-Khamis

says that notice that the Shiite says Ali (May peace upon him) and Ayesheh were under the same comforter while they have in their book “Kafi” that:

If a man and a woman are found under the same comforter, they should be given hundred lashes as a punishment. This is one of the most fundamental doubts that they use to arouse the people’s sentiment and feeling towards the Shiite creed and make them pessimist towards the Shiite creed.

They have another doubt that we will talk about it more, later which says:

The Shiite says that Ayesheh had illicit relationship and earned money through that, too.

The first answer

The Shiite's tenet is usually based on this principle that if a narration does not have document, it totally lacks validity and the Shiite does not validate an incompletely transmitted and undocumented narration. Even if a narration does have a document, they will investigate about it and if that narration has been quoted from an invalid, unknown or neglected person, it lacks validity, too. The narration that he has mentioned from Bahar Al-Anvar does neither have document to be checked, nor does it have document in the other books which have been narrated. And the narration which lacks document, lacks validity of any sort. This guy casts doubt on us about a Hadith which has no validity among the Shiite.

As I expressed before, while responding to doubts, usually when we come up with narrations, at first, we should check whether the narration has

document or not; the document is valid or not, and if it were not valid or did not have document, it lacks validity. In the Four Book of the Shiite, any one of the authors, do not claim for the correctness of all of the narrations and nor it does the owner of Bahar Al-Anvar. Existing of one Hadith in one book has nothing to do with the Shiite's belief about it since some of these narrations may have been issued for precautionary concealment [Taghiyeh] or some of the opponents may have forged this Hadith for their opposition. Then, we should examine to see whether that Hadith also has any objector or it is opposed with the exact text of Quran and traditional practice [Sunnah] or not?

Imam Sadegh himself says:

Any narration which reaches to you from us and which is opposed with the god's book, bang it to the wall.

Therefore, when a narration is used against us, the first thing to do is to examine the narration from the view point of the Shiite's theology and authoritative base and see whether the narration has validity or is justifiable or not? We can notice that the narration which has been quoted by Mr. Othman Al-Khamis , has not been mentioned by the deceased scholar Majlesi in any document to make it possible for us to find out whether its document is valid or not.

The second answer

This answer is based on rejection. You quoted a narration from the book "Bahar Al-Anvar" which lacks validity but we have numerous narrations in

this field regarding the status and respect and moral of the blessed Prophet (May peace upon him and his family) that not only do the wise accept the materials that you have brought in your books “Sehah” or “Masanid” or “Sonan” along with a valid document, but also the fool do not accept them, too.

Mr. Hakem Neishabouri is one of your scientific elites who has been praised and complimented by Zahabi and Ibn Hajr and also has been known as a specialist and sophisticated feature in the study of narrators. He has a book named “Mostadrak Al-Sahihin” which means he has brought everything that has remained from “Sahih Bokhari and Muslim” and has the characteristics to be justifiable according to Bokhari and Muslim, in this book. He states according to Zobeir’s word that:

أرسلني رسول الله في غداة باردة فأتيته و هو مع بعض نسائه
في لحافه، فأدخلني في اللحاف، فصرنا ثلاثة ... هذا حديث
صحيح الإسناد.

The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) sent for me on a cold day. I came to the holy prophet (May peace be upon him and his family) and saw he was lying under a quilt with one of his wives. He let me under the quilt and we got three. ¹

If the true narration from Behar al-Anvar has said that Ali (May peace upon him) laid under the quilt, but the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) laid between them, your narration has not mentioned whether Zobair was between them or not. What do you say about this narration? Hakem Neishaburi believes that the evidence of this hadith is valid too.

من كان بيته من زجاج ، فلا يرم الحجر.

People in glass houses shouldn't throw stones.

You who have such hadiths with true evidences

1. Mostadrak al-Sahihin, Hakem Neishaburi, vol. 3, p. 364

Should not criticize Shias.

Mojahed quotes according to Aisha with true evidence that:

كنت أكل مع النبي (صلي الله عليه و سلم) ، حيسا في قعب،
فمر عمر فدعاه، فأكل فأصابته إصبعه إصبعي، فقال حس أو أوه
لو أطاع فيكن ما رأتن عين. (و رجاله رجال الصحيح) ¹

We were eating Halva with the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) in a deep bowl. Omar entered so the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) invited him to eat. While Omar and I were eating in the same bowl, the fingers of Omar touched my fingers. Omar said: Oh! Oh no! If the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) listened to me, the eye of stranger men would not see the women.

1 .Majma al-Zavaed Heithami, vol. 7, p. 93_ Sunan Kobra Beihaghi, vol. 6, p. 435_ Dor al-Manthur, vol. 5, p. 213_ Tahzib al-Kamal Mazzi, col. 29, p. 138_ Mojam Awsat Tabrani, vol. 3, p. 212.

Mr. Othman al-Khamis! What is your idea about the touch of the hand of the wife of the prophet (may peace upon him and his family) by Omar? Is it legal or illegal? If the narrations of Behal a-Anvar says that the prophet (may peace upon him and his family) slept between Ali (may peace upon him) and Aisha, this narration indicates that the hand of the second caliph touched the hand of Aisha. Moreover, Omar had an impolite interpretation, the sentence which he further said, was not the decrease of the position of the prophet (may peace upon him and his family)? Mr. Othman al-Khamis! What would happen if you say these words to your father? If the holy prophet

(may peace upon him and his family) listened to me....

Mr. Zilaei, one of the Sunni great scholars, has a book titled as Takhrij al-Ahadith. He has mentioned some more words after writing this hadith. he wrote that Omar said:

وقال يا رسول الله يدخل عليك البار و الفاجر فلو أمرت أمهات
المؤمنين بالحجاب¹

Good and bad people come to visit you, order the faithful women to wear veil.

Does it mean that the zeal of the prophet (may peace upon him and his family) in these issues was less than Omar? Is it true?

It is said that the trustee must hold the sanctity of the shrine first. If the trustee does not respect the shrine, the others will not respect it. If we do not respect our holy prophet (May peace be upon him and his family), then we should not expect

the Christians and Jews to respect him. It is a kind of decreasing the position of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) and

1 .Takhrij al-Ahadith va al-Athar al-Zilaei, vol. 3, p. 126.

Showing the zeal of Omar more than the prophet (May peace upon him and his family). What will you answer the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) on the day of resurrection while you claim the narration is true?!!

In Sahih Moslem and Bokhari that you claim they are the most valid books after Quran, it is mentioned according the word of Aisha that:

كان رسول الله (صلي الله عليه و سلم) مضطجعا في بيتي
كاشفا عن فخذيه أو ساقيه، فاستأذن ابوبكر، فأذن له و هو علي
تلك الحال؛ فتحدث ثم استأذن عمر، فأذن له و هو كذلك؛ فتحدث
ثم استأذن عثمان، فجلس رسول الله (صلي الله عليه و سلم) و

سوي ثيابه؛ قال محمد و لا أقول ذلك في يوم واحد فتحدث؛ فلما خرج، قالت عائشة: يا رسول الله! دخل أبوبكر، فلم تهتش له و لم تباله؛ ثم دخل عمر، فلم تهتش له و لم تباله؛ ثم دخل عثمان، فجلست و سويت ثيابك؛ فقال الا استح يى من رجل تستحي منه الملائكة¹.

Once when it was my turn, the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) was laying at home as his thigh was showing completely. Mr. Abu Bakr came and said: O God's Messenger! Do you let me in? The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) let him in while his thigh was still showing. He talked to him. Then Omar came and asked the prophet (May peace upon him and his family)'s permission. The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) let him in while his thigh was showing. He talked to Omar too. at this

1 .Sahih Moslem, vol. 7, p. 117, H. 6103_ Sahih Bokhari, vol. , p. , H. _ Sunan al-Kobra Beihaghi, vol. 2, p. 231_ Fath al-Bari, vol. 7, p. 44_ Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 4, p. 82_ Mosnad Abi

Ya'ali, vol. 8, p. 240_ Sahih Ibn Hobban, vol. 15, p. 336_ the history of Damascus, vol. 39, p. 81_ the history of Islam Zahabi, vol. 3, p. 471.

time, Mr. Othman entered. As the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) saw Othman, sat and tied his clothe and covered his thigh and then they talked to each other. Then they went. I asked the prophet (May peace upon him and his family): why did not have any reaction when Omar and Abu Bakr entered and your thigh was showing, but when Othman entered you sat and tied your cloth? The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) said: Aisha! Shouldn't I be ashamed of the one who the angels are ashamed of him?!!

It means that the angels are ashamed of Mr. Othman, but not of Omar and Abu Bakr. It

indicates that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) did not have Islamic ethic and morals while Quran states:

وَإِنَّكَ لَعَلَىٰ خُلُقٍ عَظِيمٍ.¹

We would like to ask Mr. Othman al-Khamis that isn't it impolite and away from Islamic ethics that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) did not cover his thigh while Omar and Abu Bakr came in? Isn't it the opposite of hospitality? Even when the children come to their parents' house, if the father does not have the suitable clothing, he changes his clothes immediately and wears nice cloth because human courtesy demands so. Now according what you say, the holy prophet (May peace upon him and his family) did not do so.

Furthermore, your tetrad religion schools scholars have ordered that:

1 .Ghalam Sourah, verse:4.

Mr. Nabavi, one of the most important Shafeii Scholars, has said in Majmo' book, vol. 3, p. 170:

الفخذ عوزة، الركبة عورة.

The thighs and knees are parts of the genitals and it is obligatory for a man to covers his genitals from the sights of the others.

Mr. Sarakhsi, one of the most important Hanafi scholars, has said in Mabsoot book, vol. 10, p. 146:

الفخذ عوزة.

Mr. Ibn Ghodame, one of the prominent Hanbali scholars, has said in Moghni book, vol. 1, p. 616:

الفخذ عوزة.

Mr. Imam Gharbati Maleki has said in his Tafsir book, vol. 7, p. 182:

قال مالك بن أنس: أكره للرجل أن يكشف فخذَه بحضرة زوجته.

Man should not show his thigh even in front of his wife.

But it is said that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) can show his thigh to Mr. Omar and Abu Bakr.

From Wahabis: the Ifta' supreme council of Saudi Arabia has said in Fatawa al-Leljanat al-Daemat book, vol. 6, p. 178:

الركبة عورة، الفخذ عورة، ما بين السرة و الركبة عورة.

Thighs and knees are parts of the genitals. The genital is from the navel to the knees of the human.

You, who have such Fatwas, should not criticize Shias.

It also is interesting that it is mentioned in Sahih Bukhari book, vol. 3, p. 201, Chapter al-Jihad:

عن إسحاق بن عبد الله بن أبي طلحة عن أنس بن مالك رضي الله عنه أنه سمعه يقول كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم

يدخل على أم حرام بن ت ملحان فتطعمه و كانت أم حرام تحت
عبادة بن الصامت فدخل عليها رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم
فأطعمته و جعلت تقلي رأسه¹.

It is quoted from Anas Ibn Malek_the companion and the slave of the holy Prophet (May peace upon him and his family)_ that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) went to the house of Omm Haram, the daughter of Malhan.

She is one of those people who had participated in Badr battle. When Mr. Omar escaped from the battlefield and climbed the mountain and also Mr. Abu Bakr was proud of this act, she took the sword and fought with enemies. It means that she was one of those women that her zeal was more than many other men.

1 .Sahih Muslim, vol. 6, p. 49_ Mowatta Malek, vol. 2, p. 464_ Sonan Abi Davood, vol. 1, p. 559_ Sonan Tarmazi, vol. 3, p. 99_ Sonan Nesae, vol. 6, p. 40_ Sonan Kobra Beihaghi, vol.

9, p. 165_ Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 14, p. 85_ Sahih Ibn Hoban, vol. 15, p. 51.

Omme Haram was the wife of Ebadat Ibn Samet. The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) went to his house and Omme Haram cooked for him. Once the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) put his head on Omme Haram's leg and she searched his head to find his hair louses.

Long live the religion with this kind of respect to his holy prophet (May peace upon him and his family)! Was the behavior of the holy prophet (May peace upon him and his family) with a stranger woman like this?!

If we even tell this story to a Sunni student today, how would be his judgment about the prophet (May peace upon him and his family)? If we announce it in public media and international communities won't Christian youths laugh at us?

Our educated people won't laugh at us? The prophet who said:

النظافة من الإيمان.

Now they should search his hair to find fleas!

We believe that they both are working to the detriment of Islam_ Sunnis reveal the defects of Shia and Shias reveal the defects of Sunnis. But we are defending and we have no choice. You cannot criticize the oppressed person while he is defending himself, but the one who has started the fight must be reproached and blamed. Now we would like to beg Wahhabis not to do more for the sake of God and the day of resurrection. If you have faith, stop doing so. Do not pick on Ahle Bait (May peace upon him and his family) their followers.

Shias have treated in the school of Ali (May peace upon him), Imam Hassan (May peace upon

him), and Imam Hussein (May peace upon him). Shias have treated in the school of Imam Sadjad (May peace upon him) who when he entered Sham while he was captured and when the royal spokesman started to babble, said: O Yazid! Do you let me climb this pile of woods and say some sentences? Yazid said: no. they said: he is sick, let him talk. Yazid said: I know him if he starts to talk, he will decry us. He went on the pulpit by the insist of the people and disclosed the truth and all the people began to yowl and cry. Yazid noticed that there is no other way so he ordered the Muezzin to call the prayers in order to the people not to hear his voice.

Mr. Othman al-Khamis! Shia was treated in the school of Imam Sadjad (May peace upon him). You do not play with Shia like this. If you have one doubt about us, we have hundreds of doubts

about you. This nor is good for you neither is for Islam. I am ashamed of Vali Asr (AJ) when I say these sentences. I apologize him. Mr. Othman al-Khamis! You, who invade Shias and feel pity for the holy prophet (May peace upon him and his family) have mentioned in Sahih Bukhari that:

عن حذيفه قال أتى النبي (صلي الله عليه و سلم) سباطة قوم،
فبال قائما¹.

Sometimes, the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) urinated standing on the street corner.

Sabate is a place where they usually shed the garbage or the ruins of an area. The prophet (May peace upon him and his family) went there and

1 .Sahih Bukhari, vol. 1, p. 67_ Sonan Ibn Maje, vol. 1, p. 111_ Sonan Abi Davood, vol. 1, p. 14_ Sonan Nesaee, vol. 1, p. 16_ Mostadrak Hakem Neishaburi, vol. 1, p. 181_ Sonan Kobra Beihaghi, vol. 1, p. 100_ Nel al-Autar Shokani, vol. 1, p. 108_ Masnad Ahmad Hanbal, vol. 5, p. 402.

urinated standing. They brought him some water, but he did not wash himself because the water was for ablutions.

Once we were discussing with one of the Saudi Arabian enjoining men by the house of God and almost 12 youth were around us. They asked: why don't Shias act according to the Moslem and Bukhari's hadiths? In response, I told them the above mentioned hadith and said: do you like if somebody tells you that he saw your father in this position even if in the desert? Or I saw your brother in this position? It is interesting to know that a group of Pakistani Sunnis urinate standing once in a year to act according to the tradition of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family). Hurray must be said to this tradition.

The reason of quoting some narrations_ such as: the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) urinated standing, put his wife over his shoulders in order to she could see the dancing ceremony, he remembered that he had not done Jenabat ablution and went to do it,..._ in Sahih Bukhari is that they wanted to create a special place for the companions because if they want to keep people away from Ahle Bait (May peace upon them), they should make a counterfeit bill from the real bill and give it to the people. They claimed that we should obey the companions and follow them. The holy prophet (May peace upon him and his family) stated:

¹أصحابي كالنجوم، بأيهم اقتديتم اهتديتم .

My companions are like the stars. If you follow

1 .Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 1, p. 202_ Sharh Nahj al-Balaghe Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 20, p. 11_ Tafsir Alusi, vol. 1, p. 47_ Mizan al-Etedal, vol. 1, p. 413.

Any of them, you will be guided.

It means that if somebody follows Mr. Khaled Ibn Valid, he has to kill an innocent Muslim and encroach on his wife.

They realized that the companions did some acts against their position during their lifetime, so they attributed these deeds to the prophet (May peace upon him and his family). They noticed that they can not enhance the position of the companions and level them with the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) so they lowered the position of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) by these hadiths.

For example he says in Sharh Sahih Moslem Novi, vol. 3, p. 166:

فثبت أن عمر بن الخطاب و زيد بن ثابت و عبد الله ابن عمر و سهل بن سعد بالوا قياماً.

They always urinated standing. ¹

They noticed that the only way to justify their act is that to forge hadiths and attribute them to the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) _he urinated standing.

Mr. Valid was drunk and said morning prayers in four raka'ats so they forged hadith and said that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) said prayers while he had to do Jenabat ablutions.

There is a phrase in Sharh Sahih Moslem and it is mentioned in the same page that:

البول قائما أحسن للدبر.²

Urinating standing causes to keep your human diposal system safe and healthy.

Swear to God that when we hear these things,

1.Majmoo Novi, vol. 2, p. 85_ Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 3, p. 135.

2 .Sharh Sahih Moslem Novi, vol. 3, p. 166_ Fath al-Bari, vol. 1, p. 284_ Nil al-Outar Shokani, vol. 1, p. 108_ Sonan Kobra Beihaghi, vol. 1, p. 102_ Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 3, p. 136_ Kanz al-omal, vol. 9, p. 520.

we realize the value of Ahle Bait (May peace upon them) better. Friends! I say it from the bottom of my heart that we should say thanks to God that he created us from Ahle Bait (May peace upon them) and seek bless for our parents that made us familiar with Ahle Bait (May peace upon them) teachings; this is a really great blessings of God. When you study Sunni books and see these hadiths and interpretations, you will notice that these interpretations are the consequences of being away from Ahle Bait (May peace upon them) and also you will know the real meaning of the statement of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) that said:

إني تارك فيكم الثقلين، كتاب الله و عترتي و أهل بيتي؛ إن تمسكتم بهما لن تضلوا بعدي.

Mr. Abdollah Ibn Omar says:

إرتقيت يوما علي ظهر بيت لنا، فرأيت رسول الله علي لبنتين
مستقبلا بيت المقدس لحاجته¹.

We were the neighbor of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family). Once I went on top of the roof and I was watching the house of other neighbors. I was watching inside of the house of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family), I saw that he had put two bricks in the direction of Beitol Moghadas and was peeing.

How obscene and rude these narrations are!!!
Don't they know that looking into the house of others without permission is one of the great sins?! Why do they quote these narrations?! What is their purpose?

1 .Sahih Bukhari, vol. 1, p. 45_ Sahih Moslem, vol. 1, p. 185_ al-Omm Shafeii, vol. 1, p. 176_ Sonan Abi Davood, vol. 1, p. 11_ Sonan Nesae, vol. 1, p. 24_ Sonan Kobra Beihaghi, vol. 1, p. 92_ Omdat al-Ghari, vol. 2, p. 279_ Sahih Ibn Hibban, vol. 4, p. 269.

The Sirs tell us that we do not respect the prophet (May peace upon him and his family).

They say:

و فتر الوحي فترة حتى حزن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم فيما
بلغنا حزنا غدا منه مرارا كي يتردى من رؤس شواحق الجبال
فكلما أوفى بذروة جبل لكي يلقي منه نفسه تبدى له جبريل فقال
يا محمد انك رسول الله حقا فيسكن لذلك جأشه و تقر نفسه
فيرجع فإذا طالت عليه فترة الوحي غدا لمثل ذلك فإذا أوفى
بذروة جبل تبدى له جبريل فقال له مثل ذلك¹.

When no revelation was sent to the prophet (May peace upon him and his family), he decided to commit suicide. He went on top of the mountain and wanted to fall himself down. It is said that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) decided to commit suicide three times. When Gabriel saw this situation, he felt pity for

1 .Sahih Bukhari, vol. 8, p. 68, H. 6467, chapter 1:

ما بدء به رسل الله من الوحي

the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) and revealed him something.

Studying the following narration is interesting. It is quoted from Anas Ibn Malek in Sahih Bukhari, vol. 1, p. 71, H. 260:

كان النبي (صلي الله عليه و سلم) يدور علي نساته في الساعة الواحدة من الليل و النهار، و هن إحدى عشرة؛ قال قلت لأنس أو كان يطيقه، قال كنا نتحدث أنه أعطي قوة ثلاثين.

Sometimes, the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) had sex with 11 eleven of his wives during one hour. I asked Anas: does the prophet have the ability to do it? He said: I talked with the prophet in this regard. He said that God has bestowed him the power of thirty men.

Mr. Othman al-Khamis! Suppose that you say that some people that you have sex with your wife twice or three times during the night. Don't

people laugh at you? Don't tell you that you are crazy?!!

Either Mr. Anas had witnessed that or he has heard it from the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) himself. If Anas witnessed this event so he is void of justice. Is it possible that the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) himself tells him such story? Besides the religion, faith, God, and the prophet, are quoting these stories suitable? Isn't it away from morality?

It is important to note that Sunni scholars and Faghihs have issued fatwa that having concubine woman is illegal (Haram). Even Sunni Faghihs from east of our country have announced in their internet websites that temporary marriage counts as adultery, but on the other hand they have written about one of their most important Faghihs

named Abd al-Malek Ibn Jarir in most of their Rejali books that:

كان ابن جريج يري المتعة ، تزوج بستين امرأة.¹

This man has had 60 concubine wives (some say that he had 90 concubine wives).

Ibn Hajar himself says:

المتفق علي وثاقته.

All scholars agree that he is a reliable person.

It is interesting to know that they said the names of their wives to their children and told them that: they are your mothers, do not marry them.

In summary, Sirs protest Shias that they do not respect the wives of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) in their books while they quote some narrations and stories hundreds of times worse than what we say and attribute them

1 .Seir A'alam al-Nabla Zahabi, vol. 6, p. 331_ Tahzib al-Tahzib, vol. 6, p. 360.

To the prophet (May peace upon him and his family).

Dr. Seyed Muhammad Husseini Ghazvini

Name: Farhad F.

Date: 11/ 29/ 1386

Viva.

Name: Sadeghi Gh.

Date: 12/ 05/ 1386

God may increase the number of the people like you.

Name: Roghaye Khani

Date: 12/ 18/ 1386

Hi. In response to these nonsenses we have to say that not only they cannot reduce our interest to the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) by these acts but also we realize his legitimacy more and more. Thanks God that the enemies of Islam are ignorant. We have to say that you should start it from yourself.

Name: Maryam Heidary.

Date: 12/ 20/ 1386

Hi to all of dear activists in Salam international channel. These all are the characteristics of apparently Muslims. The prophet that you could smell his nice smell from some alleys away and when he passed somewhere his nice smell filled the atmosphere and stayed there. In a way that anyone could realize that the prophet had passed this place and he always suggested the people to be clean and recommended them to have zeal toward their women and other women as far as he always recommended his army to respect the women from the other tribes in wars. He always recommended them not to disrespect the old people and children. Ali (May peace upon him) had been taught by this man and fulfilled all of these cases. He had a girl like holy Fatima and her

children show that they all were born from a holy father like Hazrat Muhammad (May peace upon him and his family). There are some people who are ready to misrepresent a good person by decreasing his position in order to represent a bad person good. This is unfair. It is the sign of their inferiority.

Name: Muhammad Naderi

Date: 12/ 28/ 1386

Hi. I wish Sunni scholars pondered and studied their own books a bit more. I am so sorry for Sunni scholars because Shia scholars have more dominance over Sunni books than Sunni scholars. Sunni brothers! Study your books more and deeper and do not call Shias Rafezi and you know that what Shias do is according to the tradition of the prophet not what you do. I hope that the truth

becomes clear more and more. God keep us great scholars like Mr. Ghazvini, Ahmadi Isfahani, and other Shia scholars safe.

Name: Unknown

Date: 01/ 20/ 1387.

Swear to God that it is shameful..... how can they attribute these things and stories to the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) in their books?!....

These stories can prove Shia's legitimacy.... Believe that I was doubtful about my religion, but I searched a lot and even once I asked God to help me and show me the right path... once I consulted with Quran. The result showed Amir al-Momenin (May peace upon him) leadership verse... tears gathered in my eyes.... Ya Ali.

Name: Mir Hadi

Date: 04 /13/ 1387.

Hi.

An example: suppose that you are sure that someone is a bastard or something like this... and suppose that he himself is aware of it. Has Islam ordered you to cover his flow or reproach him in public and privacy?

Suppose that someone is foolish and ignorant. Do we have to tell him his flow?

Yes! Certainly Quran and Ahle Bait are two wings for a faithful person. You can't fly with one wing. There is no doubt on the legitimacy of the real Shia, but the struggling method of the prophet (May peace upon him and his family) or holy Imams?

What should we do if they curse us? Should we curse them back with worse words or wait and say you are in the end?

Do we step into the unity path or in the path of proving and devise?

It would be better to solve the issue of Shia Sunni that even Sunnis themselves do not notice that they have turned to Shiism! Although most of our youth are Muslims, their thoughts are Christian practically. Do we have to do cultural activities or struggle?

I hope that we take measurements that if our Imams were, would do it.

I wish God bestow me and all of us sanity and firm faith. God willing and may God succeed you and us.

Name: Mahsa Poor Saleh

Date: 06/ 03/ 1387.

I really appreciate you. At university, I have encountered Sunnis that they only have the name of Muslim and they count themselves as real Muslims. I am not going to say that Shia is better or Sunni, but Shias have been oppressed a lot during the history. I wish paid more attention to our dear prophet's goals... I wish... please write more articles of this type. It is necessary... God reward you.

Name: Ali Khayati

Date: 12/ 03/1387.

Hi Dr. Ghazvini. In the text, you have written that Imam Sadegh (May peace upon him) stated: we are

خالف الكتاب، فاضربوه علي الجدار

Do you have any evidence? If not, why did you attribute it to Imam Sadegh (May peace upon him) falsely? Please talk more cautious. Why do you call the legitimacy of four books into question to reject one hadith? Did Koleini and Sheikh Sadoogh who were contemporary with Imam (May peace upon him) know more or Rejal scholars who _a hundred years later_ studied narrative books which were very hard to understand? Remember that do not resort to wrong to prove some right. God succeed you more and more.

Answer:

Dear friend

Hello and good luck

Hadith

يضرِب عرض الحائط or مخالف قرآن يضرِب علي الجدار

Are Moslem hadiths by Shia and Shia Faghihs, from Sheikh Toosi up to now, have resorted to it as a reliable source. For example:

Sheikh Toosi (Death: 260 AH) writes:

بل قد ورد عنهم عليهم السلام ما لا خلاف فيه من قولهم :
إذا جاءكم عنا حديث فاعرضوه على كتاب الله فان وافق كتاب
الله فخذوه وان خالفه فردوه أو فاضربوا به عرض الحائط.¹

And he has stated in the interpretation of al-Tabyan book:

وروى عنه عليه السلام أنه قال : (إذا جاءكم عني حديث ،
فاعرضوه على كتاب الله ، فما وافق كتاب الله فاقبلوه ، وما
خالفه فاضربوا به عرض الحائط).²

Tabarsi, the great Shia commentator (death: 548 AH), states:

إذا جاءكم عني حديث فاعرضوه على كتاب الله ، فما وافقه
³فاقبلوه ، وما خالفه فاضربوا به عرض الحائط

1 .Edat al-Osul (T.J), al-Sheikh al-Toosi, vol. 1, p. 350

2 . al-Tabyan Sheikh Toosi, vol. 1, p. 5.

3 .Tafsir Majma' al-Bayan, al-Sheikh al-Tabarsi, vol. 1, p. 39.

The same interretation has mentioned in Safi Tafsir.¹

The owner of Hadaegh says:

وقد استفاضت الأخبار عنهم (عليهم السلام) بأن ما خالف
كتاب الله يضرب به عرض الحائط وأنه زخرف².

Vahid Behbahani writes:

وهم عليهم السلام صرحوا مكررا كثيرا أنه ما لم يكن حديثهم
موافقا للقرآن (فاضربوه عرض الجدار³.

Great Ayatollah Borujerdi states:

الأخبار الدالة على أن ما لم تعرفوا أنه قولنا فل يس منا أو أنه
زخرف ، أو فاضربوه على الجدار⁴.

Great Ayatollah Khoyi states:

لا يكون حجة بمقتضى قوله (ع) : «إنه زخرف وباطل ، أو

1. al-Tafsir al-Safi, al-Feiz al-Kashani, vol. 1, p. 36.

2. al-Hadaegh al-Nazerat, al-Mohaghegh al-Bahrani, vol. 4, p. 281.

3. al-Favaed al-Haeriyat, al-Vahid al-Behbahani, p. 284.

4. Taghrirat fi Osul al-Feghh, Taghrir Bahth al-Borujerdi, for Ishtehardi, p. 259.

لم نقله ، أو فاضربوه على الجدار¹

He stated in the introduction of Tafsir Tebyan:

وقد دلت الأخبار المتواترة على وجوب ع رض الروايات على الكتاب والسنة وأن ما خالف الكتاب منها يجب طرحه ، وضربه

على الجدار²

لروايات المتواترة التي أمرت بعرض الاخبار على الكتاب ،

³وأن ما خالف الكتاب منها يضرب على الجدار

Great Ayatollah Safi states:

فما خالف الكتاب والسنة أولم يؤخذ منهما ولم يكن مس تندا

اليهما مزخرف وباطل يضرب على الجدار.⁴

About the reliability and authenticity of Sunni foru books: the writers of thses books have never

1 .Mesbah al-Osul, Taghrir Bahth al-Khoyi, For Behsoodi, vol. 3, p. 403_ Mohazerat Fi Osul al-Feghh, Taghrir Bahth al-Khoyi, Lelfayaz, vol. 3, p. 229_ Mesbah al-Osul, Taghrir Bahth al-Khoyi, for Behsoodi, vol. 2, p. 149.

2 .al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Quran, al-Seyed al-Khuyi, p. 231.

3 .al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Quran, al-Seyed al-Khoyi, p. 265.

4 .Aman al-Omat Men al-Ekhtelaf, al-Sheikh Lotfollah al-Safi, vol. 23.

claimed that the mentioned narrations in their books are all reliable. Moreover Sheikh toosi himself has rejected the evidences of narrations frequently and on the other hand there are some narrations in these books that some great Rejali scholars like Najashi and Toosi have rejected their evidences. Based on what was said, how you can act according to the narrations of these books. In this regard, you can refer to the book¹ of professor Qazvini which is one of seminary textbooks.

Of course, you are recommended to talk about Shias faghihs and great scholars politely. As our late Imam said venturing to Maraje' cuts your relationship with Velayat. And about Omar Ibn Hanzale who is one of the most reliable persons and his narrations are count true for Faghihs:

Imam Sadegh (May peace upon him) says:

1. المدخل الي علم الرجال والدراية. page 137_ 151

... ينظران [إلى] من كان منكم ممن قد روى حديثنا ونظر في حلالنا
وحرماننا وعرف أحكامنا فليرضوا به حكما ف إني قد جعلته عليكم حاكما
فإذا حكم بحكمنا فلم يقبله منه فإنما استخف بحكم الله وعلينا رد والراد
علينا الراد على الله وهو على حد الشرك بالله.¹

One of the most important differences between Shia and Sunni is that Shias know Ijtehad well and we believe that one of the tasks of Mujtahids is researching the authenticity and reliability of narrations.

Good luck

Answering to the doubts group

Name: Ali Khayati

Date: 04/ 12/ 1389

Hi. You said that the hadith

مخالف قرآن يضرب علي الجدار يا يضرب عرض الحائط

is one of the reliable hadiths for Shia scholars. It is not true. If so, this is from Sunnis because it is

1 .al-Kafi, al-Sheikh Koleini, vol. 1, p. 67.

Not mentioned in none of Shias hadith books, neither old books, nor does in new books. Apparently this is a known phrase which is quoted from Sunni, but unfortunately Shia scholars have mentioned it in their own books without stating the narrators. On the other hand, if you found some hadith which is in contrast with the content of Quran and you could not solve its difference, keep silence and let Imams to do it since they have its knowledge. There are many narrations that you have quoted from Shia scholars in this regard, but because they do not have reliable evidences, you cannot defend them.

Answer:

Hi.

Dear friend,

It is true that late Sheikh Toosi has quoted this narration without evidence, but most of Shia scholars have agreed upon accepting this narration. So there is no need to review the evidences of the narration.

Good luck

Answering to the doubts group

Name: Ali Askari

Date: 09/ 14/ 1389.

As professor Qazvini said “people in glass houses should not throw stones.”

Name: Ibrahim

Date: 02/ 08/ 1390_ 17: 22: 37

I'm really surprised that how Shias make these false and nonsense hadiths. I have all those books that you mentioned as references. There is

not even one of those hadiths. Maybe those are your own hadiths that you attribute them to us.

Name: Momen Abdullah

Date: 02 / 09/ 1390_ 01: 30: 50

Mr. Ibrahim

Hi

Please introduce just one of hadiths which is mentioned here and you claim it is fake.

Otherwise you should repent and do not obey the sinful Imam who encourages you to libel and slander.

I'm waiting.

Ya Ali.

Name: Majid M. Ali

Date: 02 /09/ 1390.

Hi.

Mr. Namrood (Comment No. 12, Ordibehesht
08)

Are you sure???????

Labayk Ya Ali