

Is Ghoteybe Dnuri the writer of the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase"?

The group of Sunni scientists

This question has been come up by: Masud Sadeghi

Doubt

The book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" has not been written by Ibn Ghoteybe Dinuri and researchers doubt about its attribution to Ibn Ghoteybe Dinuri. The attribution of this book to him has been criticized by researchers in the east and the Muslims and no one considers it valid.

The main reason of researchers is that no one has mentioned the name of the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" in the index of his works.

Duzi believes that the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" is neither old nor valid because it includes the historical mistakes and the fanciful and illogical narrations. Hence, the attribution of such weak to Ibn Ghoteybe is not possible.

The criticism and analysis

The main narration of Ibn Ghoteybe

قال وإن أبا بكر رضي الله عنه تفقد قوما تخلفوا عن بيعته عند علي كرم الله وجهه فبعث إليهم عمر فجاء فناداهم وهم في دار علي فأبوا أن يخرجوا فدعا بالحطب وقال والذي نفس عمر بيده لتخرجن أو لأحرقنها على من فيها فقبل له يا أبا حفص إن فيها فاطمة فقال وإن فخرجوا فبايعوا إلا عليا فإنه زعم أنه قال حلفت أن لا أخرج ولا أضع ثوبي على عاتقي حتى أجمع القرآن فوقفت فاطمة رضي الله عنها على بابها فقالت لا عهد لي بقوم حضروا أسوأ محضر منكم تركتم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم جنازة بين أيدينا وقطعتم أمركم بينكم لم تستأمرونا ولم تزدوا لنا حقا.

Al-Dinvari, Abu Muhammad Abdullah Ben Moslem Ibn Ghotaybe (died in 276 hejira), Al-Emamat Al-Siyasat, v 1 p 16, Researched by: Khalil Al-Mansur, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1418 hejira- 1997, Researched by: Shiri, v 1 p 30, and Researched by: Zeini, v 1 p 19

One of doubts that Wahhabi scientists introduce, in order to deny the mentioned realities in this book, is that they say that the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" has been written by Ibn Ghotybe Dinuri.

Since Ibn Ghotybe Dinuri (died in 276 A.H) is considered as one of famous scientists and Sunni dignitaries in literature, history, jurisprudence, Hadith and the sciences of the Quran and Wahhabi scientists can not hesitate about his personality and reliability, they deny the attribution of the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" to him and degrade the degree of his validity.

Hence, research and answer are considered necessary, even if briefly.

First: this book has been published with the name of its writer " Ibn Ghotybe Dinuri" in Egypt and other countries and even several transcriptions from this book are available in all over the world such as the libraries of Egypt, Paris, London, Turkey and India.

Second: as long as there are the Islamic scientists, referring to the words of orientalist, such as Duzi, is not in the rank of a researcher and basically, is there any need to foreigners in the validity of attribution and lack of its validity? And why should we refer to some orientalist that have denied the prophet of the Islam (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants). It turns out that the Sunni scientists cannot mention any reasons and they have resorted to the orientalist.

Third: most of Sunni scientists, even their contemporary scientist and dignitaries, have said clearly about the validity of attribution of this book to Ibn Ghotybe and they have referred to it in narrating historical narrations. We will mention the names of some of them briefly.

1. Ibn Hajar Heithami in the book " Tathir Al-Janan and Al-Lesan"

Ibn Hajar Al-Heithami, Abu Al-Abbas Ahmad Ben Muhammad Ben Ali (died in 973 hejira), Tathir Al-Jenan Al-Lesan, p 72

2. Ibn Arabi Maleki says clearly about the validity of the attribution of this book to Ibn Ghotybe with narrating some matters from this book.

Ibn Al-Arabi, Muhammad Ben Abdullah Abubakr (died in 543 hejira), Al-Avasem Min Al-Ghavasem Fi Tahghigh Movaghef Al-Sahabat Bad Vafat Al-Nabi Salalaho Alaihe Vasalam, v 1 p 261, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Al-Khatib, and Mahmud Mehdi Al-Estanbuli, Published by: Dar Al-Jeil, Lebanon, Beirut, Second Edition, 1407 hejira- 1987

3. Najm Al-Din Umar Bin Muhammad Maki known as " Ibn Fahd" has written about the events of year 93 A.H.in the book " Athaf Al-Veri Beakhbar Um Al-Ghari"

و قال ابو محمد عبدالله بن مسلم ابن قتيبة في كتاب الامامة و السياسة....

Ibn Fahad, Najm Al-Din Omar Ben Muhammad Maki, Ethaf Al-Veri be Akhbar Om Al-Ghora, 93 hejira

And then he mentions the story of the arrest of " Saeid Bin Jabir" narrating from that book.

4. Ghazi Abu Abdullah Tanuzi known as " Ibn Shabat" in the book " Al-Sele Al-Samtie"

Al-Tanuzi, Abu Abdullah Al-Selat Al-Sematiye, part 2,chapter 34

5. Taghi Al-Din Fasi Maki in the book " Al-Aghd Al-Samin"

Fasi Al-Maki, Taghi Al-Din, Al-Aghd Al-Thamin, v 6 p 72

the biography of " 6. Yusef Elyan Serkis has mentioned his book apart from Ibn Ghoteybe"

2 الإمامة والسياسة ابتداء فيه بذكر فضل أبي بكر وعمر. مط النيل 1322 جزء 2 بتصحيح محمد محمود الرافعي مصر 1327 ص 395 مط الفتوح الأدبية جزء 2 1331 ص 181 و 184.

Serkis, Yusef Alyan, (died in 1351 hejira), Mojam Al-Matbuaat Al-Arabiye, v 1 p 211, Published by: Maktab Ayatollah Marashi Al-Najafi, Qom, 1411 hejira

Farid Vajdi has written in the book " Dayere Al-Maaref Al-Gharn Al-Ashrin"

اورد العلامة الدينوري في كتابه الامامة و السياسة....

Vajdi Farid, Dayerat Al-Maaref Al-Gharn Al-Eshrain, v 2 p 754

He has written in another part

... كتاب الامامة و السياسة لابي محمد عبدالله بن مسلم الدينوري المتوفى سنة 270 هـ.

Heman, p 749

8. Dr. Ahmad Zaki Sofut, the famous contemporary writer and the master of the Arabic language in the University of Egypt has narrated some matters from the book " Jamhare Khatb Al-Arab" and in several other books and he attributes it to Ibn Ghoteybe

وزاد ابن قتيبة في الإمامة والسياسة : والله يا أهل العراق ما أظن هؤلاء القوم من أهل الشأم إلا
ظاهرين عليكم.

Sofut, Ahmad Zaki, Jamharat Khatb Al-Arab, v 1 p 422, Published by: Al-Maktab Al-Elmiye, Beirut

وزاد ابن قتيبة في الإمامة والسياسة: فرق الله بيني وبينكم وأعقبني بكم من خير لي منكم وأعقبكم

Jamharat Khatb Al-Arab, v 1 p 426

نص آخر لخطبة طارق. وروي ابن قتيبة هذه الخطبة في الإمامة والسياسة بصورة أخرى.

Jamharat Khatb Al-Arab, v 2 p 316

Is the clarification of these Sunni scientists and dignitaries is enough for attributing this book to Ibn Ghoteybe?

Fourth: in spite of accepting the validity of the attribution of this book to Ibn Ghoteybe and the confirmation of the painful realities narrated about the history of the era of the Islam, some of Sunni dignitaries have found fault in him because he should have refused to narrate these realities the same as others

Ibn Arabi expresses in the book " Al-Avasem and Men Al-Ghavasem"

ومن اشد شيء على الناس جاهل عاقل أو مبتدع محتال فأما الجاهل فهو ابن قتيبة فلم يبق ولم
يذر للصحابة رسماً في كتاب الإمامة والسياسة ان صح عنه جميع ما فيه

One of hardest and the most terrible affairs in the society of an intellectual an ignorant person and the other one is tricky innovator. Ibn Ghoteybe is an ignorant intellectual that has not observed concealing realities about the companions in the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase"

Ibn Al-Arabi, Muhammad Ben Abdullah Abubakr (died in 543 hejira), Al-Avasem Min Al-Ghavasem Fi Tahghigh Movaghef Al-Sahabat Bad Vafat Al-Nabi Salalaho Alaihe Vasalam, v 1 p 261, Researched by: Moheb Al-Din Al-

Khatib, and Mahmud Mehdi Al-Estanbuli, Published by: Dar Al-Jeil, Lebanon, Beirut, Second Edition, 1407 hejira- 1987

If there are not any more reasons about the attribution of the book to Ibn Ghoteybe, only the remark of Ibn Arabi can convince people that the follower of the right path because this confession proves the attribution of the book to Ibn Ghoteybe as well as clarifies the purpose of the Sunni scientists for denying this attribution.

Sunni scientists believe that the historians and Mohadesan should not reveal the news related to the inappropriate behaviors of the companions.

If the refusal of narrating the discussions of the companions is necessary, the refusal of narrating the tyrannies and the wounds to Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him), Hazrat Fateme (peace be upon her) and other Ahle Beit (peace be upon them) will be more necessary.

It is interesting that Molavi Abd Al-Hamid Ismaeil Zehi, the Sunni Friday Imam of Zahedan mentions in his interview

We are obliged to respect the companions. We never say that the companions are innocent and they do not commit any sins. However, we should not remind their mistakes instead of reminding their good behaviors.

Nedaye Eslam Poblication , Hoze Elmiye Dar Al-Olum, Zahedan, no 4, p 11

Conclusion

According to the confession of Sunni dignitaries, the book " Al-Emame Al-Siyase" has been written by Ibn Ghoteybe Dinuri and the purpose of the Sunni scientists from its denial is to conceal realities that Ibn Ghoteybe has revealed them.

The group in charge of answering doubts

The research centre of Hazrat Valiasr