

Has the narration «فاطمة بضعة مني» been narrated by Masrur Ben Makhrame?

The group of the beliefs of Shias

This question has been come up by: M.R

The explanation of the question

Hi.

I was discussing with the Sunni scientists about the marriage proposal of Hazrat Amir Al-Momenin (peace be upon him) from the daughter of Abu Jahl. They said " Masur is Nasebie; hence, his narrations are not valid. Consequently, the narration is not valid.

What is your answer?

All of Sunni books demonstrate that the document of this narration is related to him and I did not find another valid narration in this matter. I found the narration in the book " Mostadrek Ala Al-Shahn " , but they rejected it because of Hussein Ben Yazid in the document of the Hadith and he denied Hadiths.

Answer

The narration of marriage proposal of Amir Momenan (peace be upon him) from the daughter of Abu Jahl is a false fiction. We already answered in the following address in detail.

To answer this matter, we should say that if the narration of marriage proposal from the daughter of Abu, the narration will be false because it has been narrated by Masur Nasebee.

First, our reasons for rejecting the fiction of marriage proposal from the daughter of Abu Jahl are not related only to the case that Masur Ben Mokharebe is Nasebee. We presented different reasons that you can study them at the same article.

Second, the narration has been narrated by other companions of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) with different documents.

We will narrate for each of companions an example.

Amir Al-Momenin (peace be upon him)

Bazar has narrated in the book " Mosnad"

(503)- [526] حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ الْكُوفِيُّ، قَالَ: نَا مَالِكُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، قَالَ: نَا قَيْسٌ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ عِمْرَانَ، عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ زَيْدٍ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيَّبِ، عَنْ عَلِيِّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، أَنَّهُ كَانَ عِنْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، فَقَالَ: أَيُّ شَيْءٍ خَيْرٌ لِلْمَرْأَةِ؟ فَسَكَتُوا، فَلَمَّا رَجَعْتُ قُلْتُ لِفَاطِمَةَ: أَيُّ شَيْءٍ خَيْرٌ لِلنِّسَاءِ؟ قَالَتْ: أَلَا يَرَاهُنَّ الرِّجَالُ، فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِلنَّبِيِّ (ص) فَقَالَ: إِنَّمَا فَاطِمَةُ بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا.

It has been narrated from Ali Ben Abi Taleb " I was in the messenger of God (peace of God be upon him and his descendants). The messenger of God bade " what is better than anything else for a woman?" all of companions said nothing. Ali Ben Abi Taleb says " when I came back, I said to Hazrta Fateme (peace be upon her) " what is better than anything else for women?" she answered " no man sees her". I said this matter to the messenger of God and he bade " Fateme is a part of my body. God be satisfied from her.

Al-Bazar, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Amro Ben Abd Al-Khalegh (died in 292 hejira), Al-Bahr Al-Jokhar (Mosnad Al-Bazar), v 6 p 150, Researched by: D. Mahfuz Al-Rahman Zeinollah, Published by: Olum Al-Quran Institute, Maktab Al-Olum Al-Hakam, Beirut, Medina, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Abu Harire Dusi

(2191)- [3: 1186] حَدَّثَنَا عَبِيدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عُمَرَ، أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو يَحْيَى النَّيْمِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو إِسْحَاقَ الْمَخْزُومِيُّ، عَنْ الْمُعْبَرِيِّ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص): " إِنَّمَا فَاطِمَةُ حَذِيَّةٌ مِنِّي يَفْبِضُنِي مَا فَبِضَهَا "

It has been narrated from Abu Harire that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) bade " whatever makes her sad makes me sad".

Al-Herabi, Abu Eshagh Ebrahim Ben Eshagh, (died in 285 hejira), Gharib Al-Hadith, v 3 p 1186, Researched by: D. Soleiman Ebrahim Muhammad Al-Ayed, Published by: Jameat Om Al-Ghora, Mecca, First Edition, 1405 hejira

Anas Ben Malek

(1480)- [1482] ثنا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عُمَانَ الْوَاسِطِيُّ، ثنا يَعْقُوبُ بْنُ إِبرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ عَبَّادِ بْنِ الْعَوَّامِ، ثنا عَمْرُو بْنُ عَوْنٍ، ثنا هُشَيْمٌ، ثنا يُؤُسُّ، عَنْ الْحَسَنِ، عَنْ أَنَسٍ، قَالَ : قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص): " مَا خَيْرٌ لِلنِّسَاءِ؟ " فَلَمْ نَدْرَ مَا نَقُولُ، فَسَارَ عَلَيَّ إِلَى فَاطِمَةَ فَأَخْبَرَهَا بِذَلِكَ، فَقَالَتْ: فَهَلَا قُلْتَ لَهُ: خَيْرٌ لَهُنَّ أَنْ لَا يَرَيْنَ الرَّجَالَ وَلَا يَرَوْنَهُنَّ، فَرَجَعَ فَأَخْبَرَهُ بِذَلِكَ، فَقَالَ لَهُ : " مَنْ عَلَّمَكَ هَذَا؟ " قَالَ: فَاطِمَةُ، قَالَ: " إِنَّهَا بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي " .

It has been narrated from Anas that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) asked " what is better for women?" we did know what to say. Then Imam Ali (peace be upon him) went to Fateme and informed her of this matter. Then Fateme said " why didn't you say? What is better for women is that they see no man and no man sees them". Ali came back and said such remarks to the messenger of God. The messenger of God asked " who has taught you such matters?" Imam Ali (peace be upon him) said ' Fateme has taught me such matters". The messenger of God said " Fateme is a part of my body".

Al-Asbahani, Abu Naem Ahmad Ben Abdullah (died in 430 hejira), Heliyat Al-Aoliya, v 2 p 41, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Beirut, Forth Edition, 1405 hejira

Umarv Ben Hazem Al-Ansari

قال: " فَاطِمَةُ K وَإِنَّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ بْنَ مُحَمَّدٍ يَعْنِي عَمْرُو بْنَ حَزْمٍ حَدَّثَنِي، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ جَدِّهِ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي، وَيُسَخِّطُنِي مَا أَسَخَطَهَا، وَيَرْضِينِي مَا أَرْضَاهَا " .

Al-Nasibi, Abubakr Kholad (died in 510 hejira), Favaed Abibakr Al-Nasibi, p 53, hadith 217, Researched by: Ghasam Al-Makhtutat be Sherkat Ofogh lel Barmajiyat, Published by: Sherkat Ofogh lel Barmajiyat, Egypt, First Edition, 2004

Muhammad Hanife

32269 حدثنا بن عيينة عن عمرو عن محمد بن علي قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إنما فاطمة بضعة مني فمن أغضبها أغضبني.

Ibn Abi Sheibe Al-Kufi, Abubakr Abdullah Ben Muhammad (died in 235 hejira), Al-Ketab Al-Mosnef Fi Al-Ahadith Al-Athar, v 6 p 388, Researched by: Kamal Yusef Al-Haot, Published by: Maktab Al-Roshd, Al-Riyadh, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Abdullah Ben Zobeir

(1960)- [2193] حَدَّثَنَا مُؤَمَّلُ بْنُ هِشَامٍ، قَالَ: نَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ أُيُوبَ، عَنْ ابْنِ أَبِي مُلَيْكَةَ، عَنْ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ (ص): " إِنَّمَا فَاطِمَةُ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا بَضْعَةٌ مِنِّي، يَغِيظُنِي مَا يَغِيظُهَا، وَقَالَ مَرَّةً أُخْرَى: وَيُؤْذِينِي مَا آذَاهَا ".

Fateme is a part of my body. Therefore, whatever makes her angry makes me angry. She bade once more " whatever hurts her hurts me".

Al-Bazar, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Amro Ben Abd Al-Khalegh (died in 292 hejira), Al-Bahr Al-Jokhar (Mosnad Al-Bazar), v 6 p 150, Researched by: D. Mahfuz Al-Rahman Zeinollah, Published by: Olum Al-Quran Institute, Maktab Al-Olum Al-Hakam, Beirut, Medina, First Edition, 1409 hejira

Abu Ishagh Herabi has narrated this narration with this document and text

حدثنا مسدد حدثنا إسماعيل عن ايوب عن ابن ابي مليكة عن ابن الزبير قال النبي صلى الله عليه: فاطمة بضعة مني. ينصبني ما أنصبها.

The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) bade " Fateme is a part of my body. Therefore, whatever hurts her hurts me".

Al-Herabi, Abu Eshagh Ebrahim Ben Eshagh, (died in 285 hejira), Gharib Al-Hadith, v 2 p 792, Researched by: D. Soleiman Ebrahim Muhammad Al-Ayed, Published by: Jameat Om Al-Ghora, Mecca, First Edition, 1405 hejira

Aeshe, the daughter of Abubakr

Some have narrated as Morsel that the messenger of God has said such matter to Aeshe

وروي عنه [ص] أنه قال لعائشة رضي الله عنها 'يا عائشة فاطمة بضعة مني يرييني ما يرييها.

Al-Maverdi Al-Basari Al-Shafei, Ali Ben Muhammad Ben Habib (died in 450 hejira), Al-Havi Al-Kabir Fi Feghh Mazhab Al-Emam Al-Shafei va Hova Sharh Mokhtasar Al-Mazeni, v 17 p 164, Researched by: Al-Sheikh Ali Muhammad Moavez, Al-Sheikh Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Lebanon, First Edition, 1419 hejira- 1999

Abu Ishagh Shirazi says " the martyrdom of the child is not for father because a child is a part of the body of a father.

Al-Shirazi Al-Shafei, Abu Eshagh Ebrahim Ben Ali Ben Yusef (died in 476 hejira), Al-Mazhab Fi Feghh Al-Emam Al-Shafei, v 2 p 330, Published by: Dar Al-Fekr, Beirut

Consequently, the narration has been narrated by Masur Ben Mokhrame. Other narrations have narrated it.

It is not right that you said " the narration is not right because of Hussein Ben Yazid since the Sunni dignitaries have corrected it".

حدثنا محمد بن عبد الله الحضرمي حدثنا عبد الله بن محمد بن سالم القزاني حدثنا حُ سَيْنُ بن زَيْدِ بن عَلِيٍّ عن عَلِيٍّ بن عُمَرَ بن عَلِيٍّ عن جَعْفَرِ بن مُحَمَّدِ بن أَبِيهِ عن عَلِيٍّ بن الْحُسَيْنِ عَنِ الْحُسَيْنِ بن عَلِيٍّ رضي الله عنه عن عَلِيٍّ رضي الله عنه قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لِقَاطِمَةَ رضي الله عنها أن الله يَعْضِبُ لِعَضْبِكَ وَيَرْضَى لِرِضَاكَ

Al-Tabarani, Abu Al-Ghasem Soleiman Ben Ahmad Ben Ayub (died in 360 hejira), Al-Mojam Al-Kabir, v 1 p 108, Researched by: Hamdi Ben Abd Al-Majid Al-Salafi, Published by: Maktab Al-Zahra, Al-Movasel, Second Edition, 1404 hejira- 1983

هذا حديثٌ صحيحُ الإسنادِ ولم يُخرجاهُ.

After narrating this narration, Hakem Neishaburi has said

Al-Hakem Al-Neishaburi, Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Abdullah (died in 405 hejira), Al-Mostadrak Ala Al-Sahihein, v 3 p 167, Researched by: Mostafa Abd Al-Ghader Ata, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, First Edition, 1411 hejira- 1990

After narrating the narration, Heithami has said

رواه الطبراني وإسناده حسنٌ.

Al-Heithami, Abu Al-Hasan Ali Ben Abibakr (died in 807 hejira), Majma Al-Zavaed Manba Al-Favaed, v 9 p 203, Published by: Dar Al-Riyan Leltorath/ Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Cairo, Beirut, 1407 hejira