

Has the Ghertas Hadith been narrated by Ibn Abbas?

The group of Sunni scientists

Questioner: Deldade Ali

Doubt

Sheikh Abd Al-Rahim Khatib in the book " Sheikhin", Azam in the book " Farugh " and Borghei in the book " Rahnemud" of the Sunni scientists believe that the Ghertas Hadith has a weak document. The master " Taa" says in the book " Maraa Al-Eslam" although this news has been narrated in the books of Sehad, the scientists have reasoned to some affairs in order to weaken the Hadith and they include:

1. Among the companions that attended the meeting, only Abdullah Bin Abbas has narrated the Hadith.

According to the narration of Ibn Abbas, he said

«توفى رسول الله و انا ابن عشر سنين»

"When I was ten years old, he deceased". It turns out that children did not attend the meeting; therefore, Ibn Abbas did not attend the meeting. If the prophet had said such remarks, other companions should have narrated it. Since others did not narrate this narration, it demonstrates that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) did not say such remark.

The criticism and analysis

The Ghertas Hadith is one of main faults about Umar Bin Khatab. This narration proves that he accused the messenger of God of saying nonsense remarks and did not let him write his will.

There are no main faults from the aspect of document because it has been narrated in several books of the book Sahih" of Bokhari:

SahihBokhari v 1 p 36 hadith no 114; Kitab Al-Elm; chapter no 39; chapter
Ketab al-Elm;

-Sahih Al-Bokhari v 4 p 31 hadith no 3035, Kitab Al-Jihad al-Seir chapter 176;
chapter Hal YostashfeElaAhl Al-ZemeMoamelatem

-Sahih Al-Bokhari v 4 p 66; hadith no 3168; Kitab Al-Jezie chapter Ekhranj Al-
Yahood Min Jazirat Al-Arab

-Sahih Al-Bokhari v 5 p 137 hadith no 4431; Kitab Al-Maghazi; chapter of
Marz Al-NabiVafat;

-Sahih Al-Bokhari v 7 p 9 hadith no 5669; Kitab al-Marzi chapter Ghol Al-
MarizGhomaAni

-Sahih Al-Bokhari v 8 p 161; hadith no 7366; Kitab Al-EtesamBeketab Al-
Sonat chapter 26; chapter Kerahiata Al-Khelaf

The Sunni scientists have tried to answer. One of answers is that this reader of
the site has answered.

To answer this claim, we should refer to several points:

The first point: denying all of the Hadiths of Ibn Abbas

If it is supposed that if we do not accept the narration of Ibn Abbas from the last
session of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his
descendants) with the companions, we should reject all of his narrations in all of
the chapters " jurisprudence, history, interpretation and ..."

However, the total number of the narrations of Abdullah Bin Abbas in all of the
Sunni books is 3835 without repetition and 34425 with repetition.

This is statistics presented by the program of " Javame Al-Kalam".

Can the Sunni scientists refuse all of these narrations?

The second point: Ibn Abbas was fifteen years old

There is disagreement about the age of Ibn Abbas in the time of the decease of
the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants); some
have mentioned that he was ten years old, some have said that he was thirteen
years old and others have said that he was fifteen years old. Ibn Hajar Asghalani

has said that Ahmad Bin Hanbel has considered that Ibn Abbas was ten years old.

قبض النبي (ص) ... وأنا ابن خمس عشرة . وصوبه أحمد بن حنبل.

The messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) deceased when he was fifteen years old. Ahmad Bin Hanbel has considered this opinion acceptable.

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnHajarAbulfazl (died in 852 Hejira) Tahzib Al-Tahzib v 5 p 244; published by: Dar Al-Fekr; Beirut; first editon; 1404 Hejira; 1984

Hence, definitely, no one can prove that Ibn Abbas was ten years old in that time.

The third point: Ibn Hajar is Habar Al-Ame.

The scientific position of Ibn Abbas is in the way that the Shiite and Sunni scientists can act to his narrations and they believe in him in interpretation, jurisprudence, ...

A lot of narrations have been narrated in the Sunni books about the praise of Ibn Abbas. We will refer to some remarks of Ibn Hajar about the explanation of Ibn Abbas.

وقال ابن مسعود: " نِعْمَ تَرْجُمَانُ الْقُرْآنِ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ " ...

عن بن عمر قال كان عمر يدعو بن عباس ويقربه ويقول أني رأيت رسول الله صلى الله عليه

وسلم دعاك يوما فمسح رأسك وتقل في فيك وقال اللهم فقهم في الدين وعلمه التأويل...

وعنده جبريل فقال له جبريل إنه عن عبد الله بن بريدة عن بن عباس قال انتهيت إلى رسول الله

كائن حبر هذه الأمة فاستوص به خيرا.

Abdullah Bin Masud has said " Ibn Abbas is the best interpreter of Quran". It has been narrated from the son of Umar that Umar summoned Ibn Abbas, had him sit beside himself and said " I saw that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) summoned you one day, touched your head, and put the spite of his mouth into your mouth and said " O' God! Appoint him jurisprudent in the religion and teach him the interpretation of Quran".

It has been narrated from Abdullah Bin Boride and he has narrated from Ibn Abbas " I went to the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) when Gabriel was with the prophet. Then Gabriel said to the prophet " he will become the scientist of this nation. Recommend him to good behaviors".

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnHajarAbulfazl (died in 852 Hejira) Tahzib Al-Tahzib v 5 p 244; published by: Dar Al-Fekr; Beirut; first editon; 1404 Hejira; 1984

Muhammad Bin Ismaeil in the book " Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra" and Ibn Asir in the book " Asad Al-Ghabe" have said

عَنْ لَيْثِ بْنِ أَبِي سُلَيْمٍ، قَالَ: فُلْتُ لَطَاوُسَ لَزِمْتَ هَذَا الْعُغْلَامَ، يَعْنِي ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ، وَتَرَكْتَ الْأَكَابِرَ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) فَقَالَ: " إِنِّي رَأَيْتُ سَبْعِينَ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) إِذَا تَدَارَعُوا فِي شَيْءٍ صَارُوا إِلَى قَوْلِ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ ".

It has been narrated from Leis Bin Sad that he said to Tavus " you have become the companion of this son (Ibn Abbas) and you have left the dignitaries of the companions ? Then he said " I saw seventy persons of the companions of the messenger of God that they were discussing about something and referred to Ibn Abbas".

Al-Zahari, Muhammad IbnSaadIbn Mani Abu Abdullah Al-Basri (died in 230 Hejira) Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra; v 2 p 367; published by: Dar Sader; Beirut

IbnAsir Al-Jazari, Ez Al-Din Ibn Al-AsirAbi Al-Hassan Ali Ibn Muhammad (died in 630 Hejira) Osd Al-Ghabe Fi Marefat Al-Sahabe v 3 p 297; researched by: Adel Ahamad Al-Refai; published by: Dar Ehya Al-Toras Al-Arabi; Beirut; Lebanon; First Edition; 1417 Hejira; 1996

The fourth point: the narration of Ghertas from Umar Bin Al-Khatab:

The document of this narration is not related only to Ibn Abbas, but it has been narrated only from Umar Bin Khatab

Tabarani has written in the book " Al-Majam Al-Osat"

يُذِبْنَ أَسْلَمَ، عَنِ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عُمَرَ بْنِ الْخَطَّابِ، قَالَ : لَمَّا مَرَضَ النَّبِيُّ (ص) قَالَ: " ادْعُوا لِي بِصَحِيفَةٍ وَدَوَاةٍ، أَكْتُبُ لَكُمْ كِتَابًا لَا تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُ أَبَدًا " ، فَكْرَهْنَا ذَلِكَ أَشَدَّ الْكِرَاهَةِ، ثُمَّ قَالَ : " ادْعُوا لِي بِصَحِيفَةٍ أَكْتُبُ لَكُمْ كِتَابًا لَا تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُ أَبَدًا " ، فَقَالَ النَّسْوَةُ مِنْ وَرَاءِ السُّتْرِ : أَلَا تَسْمَعُونَ مَا يَقُولُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) فَقُلْتُ: إِنَّكَ صَوَّاحِبَاتُ يُوسُفَ، إِذَا مَرَضَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) عَصْرْتُنَّ أَعْيُنُكُمْ، وَإِذَا صَحَّ رَكِبْتُنَّ عُنُقَهُ !، فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص): " دَعُوهُنَّ؟ فَإِنَّهُنَّ خَيْرٌ مِنْكُمْ "

It has been narrated from Umar Bin Al-Khatab that the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) said in the time of his disease " bring me a paper sheet and pen to write a book so that you do not go astray". . His remark made me angry a lot. The messenger of God repeated his remark again. The women behind the curtain said " didn't you hear the remark of the messenger of God?" then I said " you are like the women with Yusef (the prostituted woman that had malicious intention toward Yusuf). When the messenger of God becomes sick, tears flow from your eyes and when he is not sick, you never let him alone. then the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) said " do not hurt them; they are good woman".

Al-Tabarani, Abu Al-GhasemSoleimanIbn Ahmad IbnAyoob (died in 360 Hejira) Al-Mojam Al-Owsat v 5 p 288 hadith no 5338; researched by: TareghIbnAvaz Allah Ibn Muhammad Abd Al-Mohsen IbnEbrahim Al-Husaini; published by: Dar Al-Haramein; Cairo; 1415 Hejira

Muhammad Bin Sad has narrated it in the book " Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra" in another way

عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَسْلَمَ، عَنِ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عُمَرَ بْنِ الْخَطَّابِ، قَالَ : كُنَّا عِنْدَ النَّبِيِّ (ص) وَبَيْنَنَا وَبَيْنَ النَّسَاءِ حِجَابٌ، فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص): " اغْسِلُونِي بِسَبْعِ قَرَبٍ، وَأَتُونِي بِصَحِيفَةٍ وَدَوَاةٍ أَكْتُبُ لَكُمْ كِتَابًا لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُ أَبَدًا " ، فَقَالَ النَّسْوَةُ : انثُوا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) بِحَاجَتِهِ. قَالَ عُمَرُ: فَقُلْتُ: اسْكُنْنَ فَإِنَّكُمْ صَوَّاحِبُهُ، إِذَا مَرَضَ عَصْرْتُنَّ أَعْيُنُكُمْ، وَإِذَا صَحَّ أَخَذْتُنَّ بِعُنُقِهِ ! فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص): " هُنَّ خَيْرٌ مِنْكُمْ ! "

It has been narrated from Umar Bin Khatab that we were with the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) and there was a curtain between us and women. Then the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) said " wash me and bring ink and paper sheet to write something so that you do not go astray ". One of women said " meet the need of the messenger of God". Umar said " I said " remain silent; your are his

companions (it refers to Savaheb of Yusef). When he becomes sick, her eyes flow tears and when he is fine, they never let him alone". Then the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) said " they are better than you".

Al-Zahari, Muhammad IbnSaadIbn Mani Abu Abdullah Al-Basri (died in 230 Hejira) Al-Tabaghat Al-Kobra v 2 p 243; published by: Dar Sader; Beirut;

The fifth point: the narration of Ghertas from Jaber Bin Abdullah

This narration has been narrated by Jaber Bin Abdullah with several documents, For example, Abu Yali Museli has written in the book " Mosnad"

حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ نُمَيْرٍ، حَدَّثَنَا سَعِيدُ بْنُ الرَّبِيعِ، حَدَّثَنَا فَرَّةُ بْنُ خَالِدٍ، عَنْ أَبِي الزُّبَيْرِ، عَنْ جَابِرٍ، أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) " دَعَا عِنْدَ مَوْتِهِ بِصَحِيفَةٍ لِيَكْتُبَ فِيهَا كِتَابًا لَا يَضِلُّونَ بَعْدَهُ وَلَا يُضِلُّونَ " ، وَكَانَ فِي النَّبِيِّ لَغَطٌ، وَتَكَلَّمَ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ فَرَفَضَهَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ.

It has been narrated by Jaber that in the time of the decease of the messenger of God wanted paper sheet to write something so that you do not go astray and you do not make people go astray. There was a lot of noise in the house. Umar Bin Al-Khatab said something, but the messenger of God rejected it.

Abu Yali Al-Mosuli Al-Tamimi, Ahmad Ibn Ali Ibn Al-Mosana (died in 307 Hejira) MosnadAbiYali v 3 p 394 hadith no 1871; researched by: Husain SoleimAsad; published by: Dar Al-Mamun Al-Toras; Damascus; first edition; 1404 Hejira; 1984

After narrating the narration, Heithami has written

رواه أبو يعلي وعنده في رواية يكتب فيها كتابا لأمته قال لا يظلمون ولا يظلمون ورجال الجميع رجال الصحيح.

Abu Yali has narrated it. It has been narrated in another narration " write a letter for his nation so that they tyrannize no one and they are not tyrannized. Their narrations are the narrations of Sahih Bokhari.

-Heisami, Abu al-Hassan Nur Al-Din Ali IbnAbiBakr (died in 807 Hejira) Majma Al-Zavaed and Manba Al-Favaed v 4 p 215; published by: Dar Al-Rian Al-Toras; Dar Al-Ketab al-Arabi; Cairo; Beirut; 1407 Hejira

Salehi Shami has written

وروى أبو يعلى بسند صحيح عن جابر - رضي الله تعالى عنه - أن رسول الله - صلى الله عليه وسلم - دعا عند موته بصحيفة ...

Abu Yali has narrated it from Jaber Bin Abdullah with valid document that the messenger of God wanted paper sheet in the time of his decease...

Al-Salehi Al-Shami, Muhammad IbnYousef (died in 942 Hejira) Sabl Al-Hoda Al-Reshad Fi Sire Kheir al-Ebad; v 12 p 247; researched by: Adel Ahmad Abd al-Mojud and Ali Muhammad Moavez; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; First Edition; 1414 Hejira

Ibn Al-Erabei has narrated this narration with the following document

(541)- [539] نا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ سَعْدِ الْعَوْفِيِّ، نا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْكَرِيمِ، قَالَ : حَدَّثَنِي إِبرَاهِيمُ بْنُ عَقِيلٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ وَهْبِ بْنِ مُنَبِّهٍ، عَنْ جَابِرٍ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ (ص): " دَعَا عِنْدَ مَوْتِهِ بِصَحِيفَةٍ لَنَا لِيَكْتُبَ فِيهَا كِتَابًا لَا تَضِلُّوا، قَالَ: فَحَلَفَ عَلَيْهِمْ عُمَرُ، حَتَّى نَقُضَها النَّبِيُّ (ص) "

Ibn Al-Arabi, Abu Saeed Ahmad Ibn Muhammad IbnZiadIbnBashr (died in 340 Hejira) MojamIbn Al-Arabi; v 1 p 286; researched by: Ahmad MirinSayyad Al-Balushi; published by: Maktabat Al-Kosar; Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Riyadh; Beirut; First Edition

The document of this narration has no problem and all of its narrators are reliable.

Ahmad Bin Hanbel has narrated this narration with another document

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا موسى بن داود حدثنا بن لهيعة عن أبي الزبير عن جابر أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم دعا عند موته بصحيفة ليكتب فيها كتابا لا يضلون بعده قال فخالف عليها عمر بن الخطاب حتى رفضها .

Al-Shibani, Abu Abdullah Ahmad IbnHanbal (died in 241 Hejira) Mosnad Ahmad IbnHanbal v 3 p 346 hadith no 14768; published by: GhortobatInstitutue; Egypt

Hence, if the narration of Ibn Abbas and Umar are not acceptable, this narration has been narrated by Jaber Bin Abdullah with valid document.

The sixth point: narrating a narration from the children in the Sunni sources

We already said that Ibn Abbas was fifteen years old in the time of the decease of the messenger of God (peace of Allah be upon him and his descendants) from the point of view of Ahmad Ben Hanbel.

The Sunni scientists agree unanimously that it is possible to narrate narrations from a child of thirteen years old and even younger.

Khatib Baghdadi has written about this matter

وقال قوم الحد في السماع خمس عشرة سنة وقال غيرهم ثلاث عشرة وقال جمهور العلماء يصح

السماع لمن سنه دون ذلك وهذا هو عندنا الصواب .

We should narrate a narration from a child that is at least fifteen years old and others have said that we should narrate a narration from a child that is thirteen years. Most of the scientists have said " hearing narrations from persons that were lower than this age is also correct. This point of view is correct from my opinion.

Al-Baghdadi, AbubakrAhmad Ibn Ali IbnSabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 Hejira) Al-Kefayat Fi Elm Al-Revaya; v 1 p 54; researched by: Abu Abdullah Al-Sureghi; EbrahimHamdi Al-Madani; published by: Al-Maktab Al-Elmie; Medina

Abdullah Bin Zobeir was five years old in the Khandagh War. As we see, the events of the Khandagh War have been narrated by him in Sahih Mosalam and other Sunni books

حدثنا إسماعيل بن الخليل وسويد بن سعيد كلاهما عن بن مسهر قال إسماعيل أخبرنا علي بن

مسهر عن هشام بن عروة عن أبيه عن عبد الله بن الزبير قال كنت أنا وعمر بن أبي سلمة يوم الخندق

مع النَّسْوَةِ فِي أُطْمِ حَسَّانَ فَكَانَ يَطَاطِيءُ لِي مَرَّةً فَأَنْظُرُ وَأَطَاطِيءُ لَهُ مَرَّةً فَيَنْظُرُ فَكُنْتُ أَعْرِفُ أَبِي إِذَا مَرَّ
عَلَى فَرَسِهِ فِي السَّلَاحِ إِلَى بَنِي قُرَيْظَةَ.

It has been narrated from Abdullah Bin Zobeir " Umar Bin Abi Salame and I were with the women in the Hesan Tower in the Khandagh War. Sometimes, stood on my back and sometimes I stood on his back in order to watch the war. I understood that my father was armed and he was going with his horse toward Gharize...

Al-Neishaburi Al-Ghashiri, Abu Al-Husain Moslem Ibn al-Hojaj (died in 261 Hejira) Sahih Moslem v 4 p 1879 hadith no 2416; KetabFazaelSahabeTahlhe Al-Zobeir; researched by: Muhammad FoadAbd Al-Baghi; published by: Dar EhyaToras Al-Rabi; Beirut

Navai has said about the explanation of the narration

وفي هذا الحديث دليل لحصول ضبط الصبي وتمييزه وهو بن اربع سنين فان بن الزبير ولد عام
الهجرة في المدينة وكان الخندق سنة اربع من الهجرة على الصحيح فيكون له في وقت ضبطه لهذه
القضية دون اربع سنين وفي هذا رد على ما قاله جمهور المحدثين انه لا يصح سماع الصبي حتى يبلغ
خمس سنين والصواب صحته متى حصل التمييز وان كان بن اربع أو دونها.

This narration demonstrates the gain of the record of a child and his distinction while he is four years old because Ibn Zobeir was born in the first year of Hijrat and the Khandagh happened in the fourth year of Hijra. According to the correct opinion, he was less than four years old in recording this narration.

This narration is a rejection to what the Sunni scientists have said " it is not right to hear a narration from a child until he becomes five years old". The correct opinion is that when a child becomes an auditor, narrating narrations from him is right even though he is four years old or less than it.

Al-Navai Al-Shafei, Mohei Al-Din Abu ZakariaYahyaIbnSharafIbn Mar Ibn Mar IbnJomatIbnHazam (died in 676 Hejira) Sharh Al-NavaviSahih Moslem v 15 p 189; published by: Dar Ehya Al-Toras Al-Arabi; Beirut; Second Edition; 1392 Hejira

When Abdullah Bin Zobeir of four years old can narrate narrations and his narration can be said in Sahih Mosalam, Why can't the narration of Ibn Abbas that was fifteen years old be accepted?

The norm of narrating a narration from a child from the point of view of Sunni scientists

As Nuvi says clearly, age is not important in narrating a narration from a child, but it is important whether it is Momayez or not? What child is called Momayez?

Khatib Baghdadi has written about this matter

سألت موسى بن هارون الحمال متى يسمع الصبي الحديث قال إذا فرق بين البقرة والحمار.

I asked from Musa Ben Harun Hamal " in what conditions can we hear a narration from a child?" He said " when a child can recognize between a donkey and a cow?

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ibn Ali IbnSabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 Hejira) Al-Kefayat Fi Elm Al-Revaya; v 1 p 65; researched by: Abu Abdullah Al-Sureghi; EbrahimHamdi Al-Madani; published by: Al-Maktab Al-Elmie; Medina

Abu Umarv Shahruzi in the introduction of the book " Ibn Al-Selah", Shams Al-Din Sakhavi in the book " Fath Al-Maghis" and Ibrahim Ben Musa Al-Anbasi in the book " Al-Sheza Al-Fiah" have written this matter

Al-Kordi Al-Shahruzi, Abu Amro Osman IbnAbd Al-RahmanIbn Osman (died 643 Hejira) Olum Al-Hadith (MoghadamatIbn Al-Saleh) v 1 p 129; researched by: Nur Al-Din Etr; published by: Dar Al-Fekr Al-Moaser; Beirut; 1397 Hejira; 1997

Al-Sakhavi, Shams Al-Din Muhammad IbnAbd Al-Rahman (died in 902 Hejira) Fath Al-MaghisSharh Al-Fie Al-Hadith v 2 p 15; published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie; Beirut; Lebanon; First Edition; 1403 Hejira

Al-Abnasi Al-Mesri Al-Shafei, Abu EshaghBorhanBorhan Al-Din EbrahimIbn Musa Ibnayoob (died in 802 Hejira) Al-Shaza Al-Fiah Min OlumIbn Al-Salah v 1 p 275; researched by: Salah FathiHelal; published by: Maktabat Al-Roshd; Riyadh; first editon; 1418 Hejira; 1998

Seraj Al-Din Ansari known as Ibn Molghan has written about this matter in the book " Al-Moghna"

وأما كتابته وتقييده فمن حين أهله له ويختلف باختلاف الأشخاص ولا يتقيد بسن مخصوص . فقال موسى بن هارون إذا فرق بين البقرة والدابة .

Writing and its conditions: the time of preparation for narrating a narration is in comparison with different persons and it is not related to a certain age. Then Musa Ben Harun Hafez has said "when we can narrate a narration, a child can recognize a cow from other animals.

Al-Ansari Al-Shafei, Seraj Al-Din AbiHafs Omar Ibn Ali Ibn Ahmad Al-MaroufIbnMolghen (died in 804 Hejira) Al-Moghne Fi Olum Al-Hadith v 1 p 290; researched by: Abdullah IbnYousefAl-Jadi; published by: Dar FovazNashr; Saudi; first edition; 1413 Hejira

Badr Al-Din Eini has written about this matter in the book " the explanation of Sahih Bokhari"

واختلفوا في السن الذي يصح فيه السماع للصغير ، فقال موسى بن هارون الحافظ : إذا فرق بين

البقرة والدابة .

Al-Eini Al-Ghitabi Al-HanafiBadr Al-Din Abu Muhammad Mahmud Ibn Ahmad (died in 855 Hejira) Omdat Al-GhariSharhSahih Al-Bokhari v 2 p 68; published by: Dar EhyaToras Al-Arabi; Beirut

Scientists have disagreement about the age that is appropriate to hear a narration from a child. Then Musa Ben Harun Hafez has said " when we can narrate a narration, a child can recognize a cow from other animals.

The baby that answered all of jurisprudence matters:

Mahya Al-Din Ibn Arabi has collected different stories about the babies that talked in the cradle and the stomach of their mother in the book " Al-Fotuhah Al-Makie".

He has also narrated a story from his daughter that is interesting to be heard:

وأما ما يناسب الكلام فإن ابنتي زينب سألتها كالملاعب لها وهي في سنّ الرضاعة وكان عمرها في ذلك الوقت سنة أو قريباً منها فقلت لها في حضور أمها وجدتها يا بنية ما تقولين في الرجل يجامع أهله ولا ينزل فقالت يجب عليه الغسل فتعجب الحاضرون من ذلك.

It is appropriate to be said here " I asked my daughter, Zeinab, some questions when I was playing with her and she was around one years old. I said to him in the presence of his mother and grandmother " O' my daughter! What is your opinion about a man that has sexual intercourse with his wife, but Enzal does not happen? " He said " ceremonial washing is not necessary for him". Then the present people got surprised of this matter.

Ibn Al-Arabi Al-Tae Al-Khatami, Mohei Al-Din Ibn Ali Ibn Muhammad (died in 638 Hejira) Al-fotuh Al-Makie Fi Marefat Al-Asrar Al-Melkie v 4 p 120; published by: Dar EhyaTorasArabi; Lebanon; first editon; 1418 Hejira; 1998

Halabi has narrated this story from Ibn Arabi.

Al-Halabi, aliIbnBorhan Al-Din (died in 1044 Hejira) Al-Sirat Al-Halbie Fi Sire Al-Amin Al-Mamun; v 1 p 127; published by: Dar Al-Marefat; Beirut; 1400 Hejira

Conclusion

Since it is possible to narrate narrations from a child that is four years old and can recognize between cow and donkey and a baby can answer jurisprudence questions, what is wrong with narrating narrations from Ibn Abbas that is five years old and even ten years old?

Good luck

The group in charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr