

Did some narrators of Sehad Sete drink wine?

Questioner: Salimi

The explanation of the question

On " Velayat" channel, your expert said " Vakie Bin Jarah that is one of narrators of Sehad Sete drank wine. However, it has been claimed that in some channels of Wahhabite that there is no valid document that that the narrators of " Sahih Bokhari" drank wine. If so, it is related to the time that they did not narrate the narrations. Is this claim valid?

Answer

One of the most important narrators of Sehad Sete is Vakie Bin Jarah. Mezi has written about him in the book " Tahzib Al-Kamal"

روى له الجماعة.

All of the narrators of Sehad Sete have narrated narrations from him.

Al-Mazi, Abu Al-Hajaj Yusef Ben Al-Zaki Abd Al-Rahman (died in 742 hejira), Tahzib Al-Kamal, v 30 p 484, Researched by: D. Bashir Ovad Maruf, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, First Edition, 1400 hejira- 1980

According to the Sunni valid narrations, he drank wine and even some narrations confirm the reality of this matter and relate it to the time he started narrating Hadiths.

The first narration: Yaghub Bin Sofyan Fasvi

Yaghub Bin Sofyan (died in 277 A.H.)that is one of students Ahmad Bin Hanbel (died in 241 A.H.), Ahmad is the student of Vakie, narrates that Ahmad said

وقد سئل أحمد بن حنبل : إذا اختلف وكيع وعبد الرحمن بن مهدي بقول من تأخذ؟ فقال : عبد

الرحمن يوافق أكثر و خاصة سفیان كان معنيا بحديث سفیان وعبد الرحمن يسلم عليه السلف ويجتنب

شرب المسكر.

Ahmad Bin Hanbel was asked " if Vakie Bin Abd Al-Rahman Bin Mahdi disagree with each other in narrating narrations, which one of them will you believe in his narrations?

He answered " mostly, the remarks of Abd Al-Rahman are right especially in narrating from Sofyan because Abd Al-Rahman had special attention toward Sofyan. Self (the dignitaries in the past) was safe from Abd Al-Rahman (he did not abuse them) and Abd Al-Rahman did not eat whatever made them drunk.

Al-Fasavi, Abu Yusef Yaghub Ben Sofyan (died in 277 hejira), Al-Marefat Al-Tarikh, v 1 p 413, Researched by: Khalil Mansur, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, 1419 hejira- 1999

The meaning of the remark of Ahmad Bin Hanbel is that Vakie Bin Jarah drank alcoholic drinks because if Vakie had not had these features, it would have been meaningless that Ahmad referred to the superiority of Abd Al-Rahman Bin Mahdi to him about this feature. Moreover, if he had drunk wine before he had narrated any narrations, it could not have effected on the validity and the falsity of his narrations.

Consequently, this narration proves that he drank wine and he narrated his narrations when he drank wine. The document of the narration about Ahmad is valid because Fasva has narrated from Ahmad Bin Hanbel directly and both of them are the best Mohadesan and the Sunni narrators.

The second narration: Khatib Baghdadi

He narrates in the book " history"

قرأت على التنوخي عن أبي الحسن أحمد بن يوسف بن يعقوب بن إسحاق بن البهلول الأنباري

قال حدثني أبي قال حدثني جدي إسحاق بن البهلول قال قدم علينا وكيع بن الجراح فنزل في المسجد على

الفرات فكنت أصير إليه لاستماع الحديث منه فط لب مني نبيذا فجئته بمخيسة ليلا فأقبلت أقرأ عليه

الحديث وهو يشرب فلما نفذ ما كنت جئته به أطفأ السراج فقلت له: ما هذا؟ فقال: لو زدتنا لزدناك.

I read the narration in the presence of Tanukhi. Abu Al-Hsan Ahmad Bin Yusef Bin Yaghub from his father and he has narrated from his grandfather, Ishagh Bin Bahlul, that said " Vakié Bin Jarah came to us and he resided in the mosque beside Forat. I went to him in order to hear the narration. He asked me Nabiz (the wine of raisin). In the time of night, I brought ripe wine for him. I recited narrations (from his pamphlets) and he also drank wine. When he drank all of wine, he turned off the light (so that I could not read). I said to him " why are you behaving in this way?" he said " if you had brought me more wine, we would have let you read more narrations.

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 Hejra), Tarikh Baghdad, v 13 p 502, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Analyzing the document of the narration

Al-Tanukhi, the master of Khatib Baghdadi

Zahabi has said about him

5926 [5947] علي بن المحسن أبو القاسم التنوخي سماعته صحيحة ... قلت محله الصدق

والستر.

Ali Bin Mohsen Tanukhi has heard narrations properly. He is honest and pious.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Mizan Al-Etedal Fi Naghd Al-Rejal, v 5 p 184, Researched by: Al-Sheikh Ali Muhammad Moavez and Al-Sheikh Adel Ahmad Abd Al-Mojud, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, First Edition, 1995

Ahmad Bin Yusef Bin Yaghub

Ibn Asir has said about him

وفيهما توفي أحمد بن يوسف بن يعقوب بن البهلول... وكان عبدا محدثا ثقة.

In this year, Ahmad Bin Yusef Bin Yaghub passed away and Abed was Mohades and a reliable person.

Ibn Athir Al-Jazari, Ez Al-Din Ben Al-Athir Abi Al-Hasan Ali Ben Muhammad (died in 630 hejira), Al-Kamel Fi Al-Tarikh, v 7 p 429, Researched by: Abdullah Al-Ghazi, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Second Edition, 1415 hejira

Yusef Bin Yaghub Bin Ishagh Bin Bahul

Khatib Baghdadi has said about him

يوسف بن يعقوب بن إسحاق بن البهلول... وكان ثقة

Yusef Bin Yaghub was reliable.

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 14 p 321, no 7644, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Ishagh Bin Bahul

Khatib Baghdadi has said about him

إسحاق بن البهلول... وكان ثقة... وقال عبد الرحمن بن أبي حاتم سألت أبي عن إسحاق بن بهلول

الأنباري فقال صدوق.

Ishagh Bein Bahul was reliable. Abd Al-Rahman Bin Abi Hatem says " I asked my father about him and he said " he is honest".

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 6 p 366, no 3390, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Hence, the document of the narration is valid and it demonstrates that Vakie drank wine along with narrating Hadith.

The third narration:

Khatib Baghdadi narrates in this way

أخبرنا هلال بن محمد الحفار أخبرنا إسماعيل بن محمد الصفار حدثنا جعفر بن محمد يعني الطيالسي قال: سمعت يحيى بن معين يقول: سمعت رجلا سأل وكيعا فقال: يا أبا سفيان شربت البارحة نبيذا فرأيت فيما يرى النائم كأن رجلا يقول إنك شربت خمرا، فقال وكيع: ذاك الشيطان

Yahya Bin Moein said " I heard that a person was talking to Vakie and he said to him " O' Aba Sofyan! I drank Nabiz (the wine of raison) last night. I saw in my dream that they said to me " you have drunk some alcoholic drink". Vakie said " the person that said this remark was Satan! (In other words, Nabiz is not Haram).

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 13 p 502, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Analyzing the document of the narration

Halal Bin Muhammad Hafar

Zahabi has said about him

الحفار الشيخ الصدوق مسند بغداد أبو الفتح هلال بن محمد.

Hafar was an honest master and Mosnad of Baghdad (a person that all gave him documents).

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 17 p 293, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Ismaeil Bin Muhammad Bin Ismaeil Bin Saleh Bin Abd Al-Saleh

إسماعيل بن محمد بن إسماعيل بن صالح بن عبد الرحمن الصفار الثقة الإمام النحوي المشهور

حدث عن الحسن بن عرفة وأحمد بن منصور الزيادي والكبار وانتهى إليه علو الإسناد روى عنه

الدارقطني وابن مندة والحاكم ووثقوه.

Ismaeil Bin Muhammad was a reliable person, Imam and the famous scientist of the science of syntax. All of the valuable documents come from him. Dar Ghatani, Ibn Mende and Hakem have narrated narrations from him and they have Tosikh him.

Al-Asghalani Al-Shafei, Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Hajar Abu Al-Fazl (died in 852 hejira), Lisan Al-Mizan, v 1 p 432, Researched by: Daerat Al-Maaref Al-Nezamiye, India, Published by: Al-Alami lel Matbuat Institute, Beirut, Third Edition, 1406 hejira- 1986

Jafar Bin Muhammad Bin Usman Al-Tayalesi

جعفر بن محمد بن أبي عثمان الحافظ المجود أبو الفضل الطيالسي البغدادي .. قال أحمد بن

المنادى كان مشهورا بالاتقان والحفظ والصدق قال الخطيب كان ثقة ثبتا حسن الخط صعب الأخذ مات

في رمضان سنة اثنتين وثمانين ومائتين.

Jafar Bin Muhammad was a hafez that memorized well. Ahmad Bin Monadi has said " he was honest and a famous Hafez". Khatib has said " he was reliable and he had very nice handwriting".

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Tazkerat Al-Hefaz, v 2 p 626, no 653, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut, Second Edition

Yahya Bin Moein

يحيى بن معين. هو الامام الحافظ الجهيد شيخ المحدثين أبو زكريا يحيى بن معين ... قال عبد الرحمن بن أبي حاتم سئل أبي عن يحيى فقال امام. قال النسائي أبو زكريا أحد الائمة في الحديث ثقة مأمون.

Yahya Bin Moein was a leader, Hafez and Jahbez (he was an educated person and a scientist and he was able to recognize good features from bad ones. this is a Persian word. he was the master of Mohadesin. Abd Al-Rahman Bin Abi Hatem says " I asked my father about him". He said " he is Imam". Nasaee has said " he is one of leaders in the science of Hadith and he was reliable.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 11 p 71, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnout, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

The fourth narration: Khatib Baghdadi

أخبرنا بن الفضل أخبرنا دعلج أخبرنا أحمد بن علي الأبار حدثنا محمد بن يحيى قال : قال: نعيم

بن حماد: تعشينا عند وكيع أو قال : تغدينا فقال أي شيء تريدون أجيبكم به نبيذ الشيوخ أو نبيذ الفتیان؟

قال: قلت: تتكلم بهذا قال هو عندي أحل من ماء الفرات قلت له : ماء الفرات لم يختلف فيه وقد اختلف في

هذا.

It has been narrated from Naeim Ben " we ate dinner or lunch with Vakie. Then he said " what do I bring for you? Do I bring the wine of the old people or the wine of young people? " I said " are you talking about wine?" he answered " my wine is more delicious than the water of Forat". I said " there is no disagreement that water is delicious, but there is disagreement about whether wine is dissolvable or not.

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 13 p 502, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Analyzing the document of the narration

Muhammad Bin Al-Hussein Bin Al-Fazl

القطان. الشيخ العالم الثقة المسند أبو الحسين محمد بن الحسين ابن محمد بن الفضل البغدادي

القطان الأزرق. وحدث عنه البيهقي والخطيب ومحمد بن هبة الله اللالكائي وأبو عبد الله الثقفي وجماعة

سواهم. وهو مجمع على ثقته.

Al-Ghatan was a master, a scientist and a reliable person. Beihaghi, Khatib and ...have narrated a narration from him. All of the scientists of the science of men agree unanimously that he is reliable.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 17 p 331, 332, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Daalj Bin Ahmad

دعلاج. دعلاج بن أحمد بن دعلاج بن عبد الرحمن المحدث الحجة الفقيه الإمام أبو محمد السجستاني
ثم البغدادي التاجر ذو الأموال العظيمة ... قال أبو سعيد بن يونس حدث بمصر وكان ثقة ... وقال الحاكم
دعلاج الفقيه شيخ أهل الحديث في عصره...

Daalj was A Mohades, a Hojat (a person has memorized three hundred thousand Hadiths), jurisprudent and Imam. Abu Saeid Bin Yunes has said " he narrated narrations in Egypt and he was reliable". Hakem has said " Daalj was jurisprudent and the master of Mohadesin in his time.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 16 p 31, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnout, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Ahmad Bin Ali Al-Abar

الأبار. الحافظ المتقن الإمام الرباني أبو العباس أحمد بن علي بن مسلم الأبار من علماء الأثر
بيغداد... قال الخطيب كان ثقة حافظا متقنا حسن المذهب. وقال جعفر الخدي كان الأبار من أزهد الناس.

Ahmad Bin Ali was a permanent Hafez, the leader of Rabanei and the scientists of the science of Hadith in Baghdad. Khatib has said " he was a reliable person and a permanent Hafez. Jafe Khaldi has said " he was on the most pious persons".

Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 13 p 443

Muhammad Bin Yahya

He was one of narrators of Bokhari, Mosalam and other Sehah Sete

الذهلي. محمد بن يحيى بن عبدالله بن خالد بن فارس بن ذؤيب الإمام العلامة الحافظ البارع شيخ
الإسلام وعالم أهل المشرق وإمام أهل الحديث بخراسان أبو عبدالله الذهلي مولا هم النبي سابوري... وقال
الخطيب كان أحد الأئمة العارفين والحفاظ المتقنين صنف حديث الزهري وجوده وكان أحمد بن حنبل
يثني عليه وينشر فضله... قال زنجويه بن محمد كنت أسمع مشايخنا يقولون الحديث الذي لا يعرفه محمد

بن يحيى لا يعبا به... قال ابن أبي حاتم كتب أبي عن محمد بن يحيى بالري وهو ثقة صدوق إمام من أئمة

المسلمين وثقه أبي وسمعه يقول هو إمام أهل زمانه... وقال النسائي ثقة مأمون. وقال ابن أبي داود حدثنا

محمد بن يحيى وكان أمير المؤمنين في الحديث.

Muhammad Bin Yahaya Zehli was a leader, Alame, a Hafez, a pious person, the Sheikh of the Islam and the scientist of the eastern people and the leader of Mohadesin in Khorasan (one of cities in Iran). Khatib has said " he was one of educated leaders and one of permanent Hafezs ". Ahmad Bin Hanbel praised him and stated his virtues. Zanjuye has said " I heard that my masters said " the Hadith that Muhammad Bin Yahya does not recognize has no worth paying attention. Ibn Abi Hatam has said " my father narrated narrations from him in Rei (one of cities in Iran) and he was an honest person and he was the leader of leaders of the Muslims. My father tosikh him and I heard that he said " he was the leader of the people in his time" Nasaee has said about him " he was reliable and honest". Ibn Abi Davud has said" Muhammad Bin Yahya Amir Al-Momenin in the science of Hadith.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 12 p 273, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Naeim Bin Hemad

He was one of narrators of Bokhar.

There are two different points of views about him. Some have Tosikh him and they have considered him as one of Imam of Alam and some have weakened him. However, Shams Al-Din Zahabi has mentioned his name in the book "

«ذكر من تكلم فيه وهو موثق»

نعيم بن حماد خ مقرونا د ت ق حافظ وثقه أحمد وجماعة واحتج به البخاري...

Naeim Bin Hemad was Hafez. Ahmad Bin Hanbel and some persons have tosikh him. Bokhari reasoned to his narration (he has narrated from him in " Sahih Bokhari" as a document".

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Zakara Asmaa Man Takalama Fihe vahova

Mothegh, v 1 p 184, Researched by: Muhammad Shakur Amreir Al-Mayadini,
Published by: Maktab Al-Menar, Al-Zargha, First Edition, 1406 hejira

Then he has narrated some weak points about him.

He has written in the book " Alam Al-Nobala"

نعيم بن حماد بن معاوية . ابن الحارث بن همام بن سلمة بن مالك الإمام العلامة الحافظ أبو عبد
الله الخزاعي المروزي الفرضي الأعور صاحب التصانيف...
قال أبو بكر الخطيب يقال إن أول من جمع المسند وصنفه نعيم . يوسف بن عبد الله الخوارزمي
سألت أحمد بن حنبل عن نعيم بن حماد فقال لقد كان من الثقات ... إبراهيم بن عبد الله بن الجنيد سمعت
يحيى بن معين وسئل عن نعيم فقال ثقة... قال أبو زكريا نعيم ثقة صدوق رجل صدق أنا أعرف الناس به
كان رفيقي بالبصرة كتب عن روح خمسين ألف حديث ... قال أحمد العجلي نعيم بن حماد ثقة مروزي...
وقال أبو حاتم محله الصدق.

Naeim Bin Hemad was Imam, Alame and Hafez. Khatib Baghdadi has said " the first person that collected the narrations of Mosnad was Naeim Bin Emad". Yusef Bin Abdullah Kharezmi has said " I asked Ahmad about Naeim Bin Hemad ". He said " indeed, he is one of Saghat". Ibrahim Bin Abdullah has said " I heard that Yahya Bin Moein said about Naeim " he is reliable". Abu Zakaria has said " Naeim was reliable and honest. He told the truth and I know him more than others. He was my friend in Basre. He had written fifty thousand Hadiths about the soul. Ahmad Ajali has said " Naeim Bin Hemad was reliable". Abu Hatem has said " he was honest".

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 10 p 595, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Other narrations

Zahabi has said in different books that he drank wine. He has narrated this matter narrating from other Sunni scientists

وقد روى غير واحد أن وكيعاً كان يترخص في شرب النبيذ.

A lot of narrators have narrated " Vakiie did not prohibit eating Nabiz".

Several narrators have narrated " Vakiie did not prohibit drinking the wine of raisin".

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Tarikh Eslam va Vafiyat Al-Mashahir Al-Alam, v 13 p 441, Researched by: D. Omar Abd Al-Salam Tedmeri, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Lebanon/ Beirut, First Edition, 1407 hejira- 1987

He has written in other parts " he narrates that Abu Saeid Ashaj said

وقال أبو سعيد الأشج كنت عند وكيع فجاءه رجل يدعوهُ إلى عرس فقال أتم نبيذ قال لا قال لا

نحضر عرسا ليس فيه نبيذ قال فإني أتاكم به فقام.

Abu Saeid Ashaj said " when I was in the presence of Vakiie, someone invited him to the wedding ceremony. He asked " will Nabiz be served in the ceremony". He answered " no". He said " I will not take part in the wedding ceremony that Nabiz will not be served". He said " I will serve Nabiz for you". Therefore, Vakiie took part in the ceremony.

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Seir Alam Al-Nobala, v 9 p 155, Researched by: Shoaib Al-Arnawt, Muhammad Naeem Al-Araghsusi, Published by: Resalat Institute, Beirut, Ninth Edition, 1413 hejira

Al-Zahabi Al-Shafei, Shams Al-Din Abu Abdullah Muhammad Ben Ahmad Ben Osman (died in 748 hejira), Tarikh Eslam va Vafiyat Al-Mashahir Al-Alam, v 13 p 442, Researched by: D. Omar Abd Al-Salam Tedmeri, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Arabi, Lebanon/ Beirut, First Edition, 1407 hejira- 1987

Khatib Baghdadi has narrated another narration

حدثت عن أبي الحسن الدارقطني قال حدثني القاضي أبو الحسن محمد بن صالح بن علي بن أم

شيبان الهاشمي قال حدثني أبي قال حدثنا أبو عبد الرحمن سفيان بن وكيع بن الجراح قال حدثني أبي قال

كان أبي وكيع يصوم الدهر ... ثم يدخل إلى منزله فيقدم إليه إفطاره وكان يفطر على نحو عشرة أرطال

من الطعام ثم يقدم له قربة فيها نحو من عشرة أرتال نبيذ فيشرب منها ما طاب له على طعامه ثم يجعلها بين يديه ويقوم فيصلي ورده من الليل وكلما صلى ركعتين أو أكثر من شفع أو وتر شرب منها حتى ينفذها ثم ينام.

It has been narrated from the child of Vakie " my father fasted. They brought ten Retell (each Retell includes two and half kilogram) food for him in the time of Eftar(breaking a fast) and he broke his fast with it. Then they brought him a musk that included about ten Retell the wine of raison. He drank however much he liked. Then he put it beside himself, stood and prayed. Whenever he fulfilled two rokats (unit of Moslem prayer) of his prayer or more, he drank some it until the musk became empty. Then he went to his bed.

Al-Baghdadi, Abubakr Ahmad Ben Ali Ben Thabet Al-Khatib (died in 463 hejira), Tarikh Baghdad, v 13 p 501, Published by: Dar Al-Kotob Al-Elmie, Beirut

Of course, there are other narrations about his drinking wine, but we have mentioned only these narrations briefly.

Consequently, Vakie Bin Al-Jerah was the narrator of the Sunni Seah Sete, drank alcoholic drinks and did not prohibit drinking alcoholic drinks. the Sunni scientists have narrated narrations from him.

Good luck

The group in the charge of answering doubts

Research centre of Hazrat Valiasr