

Is this narrative «من سبّ عليا فقد سبني» written in Sunni resources with authentic document?

Response:

Enmity towards commander of the faithful Ali [AS] and swearing at him by Sahaba are amongst things that there is no doubt about them, even "Ibn Taymiyyah Harani" has confessed to it:

«الرابع أن الله قد أخبر أنه سيجعل للذين آمنوا وعملوا الصالحات ودا وهذا وعد منه صادق ومعلوم أن الله قد جعل للصحابة مودة في قلب كل مسلم لا سيما الخلفاء رضي الله عنهم لا سيما أبو بكر وعمر؛ فإن عامة الصحابة والتابعين كانوا يودونهم، وكانوا خير القرون. ولم يكن كذلك علي، فإن كثيرا من الصحابة والتابعين كانوا يبغضونه ويسبونه ويقاتلونه»

Fourth: god has said: "indeed those who have believed and done good deeds, god almighty will put their kindness in people's heart" and it's clear that god has put love towards Sahaba in each Muslim's heart; particularly caliphs, "Abu-Bakr" and "Umar" in particular, because all companions of Prophet [PBUH] and "Tab'in" {those who met some of companion of prophet [PBUH] and believed in Prophet's prophetic mission but they didn't meet prophet Muhammad} would like them and that time is amongst best centuries, it's not true about "Ali"; because many of Sahaba and "Tabi'in" had enmity towards "Ali" in their heart and would insult and fight him.

"Ibn Taymiyyah" – Minhaj al-Sunnah, vol. 7, p 137 – 138

We understand two points of his saying:

1: commander of the faithful Ali [AS] was not believer and hadn't done good deeds; that's why god didn't put his love in the heart of Sahaba and "Tabi'in" while god has said in "Quran" that he puts the love towards believers in the heart of people.

2: many of Sahaba and "Tabi'in" would hold grudge against "Ali ibn abi Talib" [AS] in their heart and insult and fight him.

First point isn't the topic of our conversation. What is important for us is the confession of "Ibn Taymiyyah" to this issue that many of Sahaba would swear at "Ali ibn abi Talib" [AS].

And he says in another place when he compares the opponents of commander of the faithful Ali [AS] and opponents of "Uthman" with each other:

فَالْمُنَزَّهُونَ لِعُثْمَانَ الْقَادِحُونَ فِي عَلِيٍّ أَعْظَمُ وَأَدِينٌ وَأَفْضَلُ مِنَ الْمُنَزَّهُينَ لِعَلِيٍّ الْقَادِحِينَ فِي عُثْمَانَ، كَالزَّيْدِيَّةِ مَثَلًا.

فَمَعْلُومٌ أَنَّ الَّذِينَ قَاتَلُوهُ وَلَعَنُوهُ وَدَمَّوْهُ مِنَ الصَّحَابَةِ وَالتَّابِعِينَ وَغَيْرِهِمْ هُمْ أَعْلَمُ وَأَدِينٌ مِنَ الَّذِينَ بَتَوَلَّوْهُ وَيَلْعَنُونَ عُثْمَانَ

Those who would know "Uthman" innocent and find fault with "Ali ibn abi Talib" were older and more believer than those who would know "Ali" innocent and find fault with "Uthman"; such as: "Zaydiyyah".

So, it's clear that Sahaba and "Tabi'in" and others who fought "Ali", insulted him and said bad things about him were more knowledgeable and believer than those who would like "Ali" and insult "Uthman".

"Ibn Taymiyyah" – Minhaj al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyah – vol. 5, p 10

And we understand from this saying of "Ibn Taymiyyah" that some of companions fought "Ali" [AS] and insulted him.

And he also says rejecting this narrative that “we’d know infidels via their grudge towards Ali ibn Talib [AS]”:

“الثالث أن يقال لو ثبت انه قاله فمجرد قول أبي سعيد قول واحد من الصحابة و قول
الصاحب إذا خالفه صاحب آخر ليس بحجة باتفاق أهل العلم وقد علم قدح كثير من الصحابة
في علي”

Third: even if we accept that this narrative is true, if one of the companions has opposed this saying of “Abu Sa’id Khederi” who is one of the companions, this narrative won’t be reliable as all scholars say, and it’s clear that many of Sahaba would insult “Ali ibn abi Talib”.

“ibn Taymiyyah” – Minhaj al-Sunnah, vol. 7, p 146

Now that it was proved that many of companions would swear at commander of the faithful “Ali” [AS], we say narratives about the “Hukm” {Hukm is a reference to the Islamic commandments, derived and understood from religious jurisprudence resources. A law, value, ordinance or ruling of Shari'ah {Islamic law} of insulting commander of the faithful “Ali” [AS] written in Sunni books.

This narrative «من سب عليا فقد سبني» has been quoted with several documents that at least two of them are authentic and we can’t find fault with them:

“الثالث أن يقال لو ثبت انه قاله فمجرد قول أبي سعيد قول واحد من الصحابة و قول
الصاحب إذا خالفه صاحب آخر ليس بحجة باتفاق أهل العلم وقد علم قدح كثير من الصحابة
في علي”

First narrative: “Abd Allah al-Jadali” from Umm Salama”:

“Ahmad ibn Hanbal” and other Sunni elders have quoted:

26791 حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا يحيى بن أبي بكير قال ثنا إسرائيل عن أبي إسحاق عن عبد الله الجدلي قال دخلت علي أم سلمة فقالت لي أيسب رسول الله (ص) فيكم قلت معاذ الله أو سبحان الله أو كلمة نحوها قالت سمعت رسول الله (ص) يقول من سب علياً فقد سبني.

“Abd Allah ibn Jadali” says: I went to “Umm Salama”, she told me: is there anyone amongst you who insults messenger of god [PBUH]? I said: refuge to god ... she said: I heard of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] who said: those who insult “Ali” [AS] have in fact insulted me.

“Ahmad ibn Hanbal” – Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal – vol. 6, p 323 /// “Al-Nisa’i” – virtues of Ali ibn abi Talib – vol. 1, p 111 ///

After quoting this narrative, “Al-Hakim Nishapuri” says:

“هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه”

The document of this narrative is authentic but “Muslim” and “Bukhari” haven’t quoted it.

“Al-Hakim Nishapuri” – al-Mustagrak alaa al-Sahhihain – vol. 3 – p 130

And “Haythami” says:

“رواه أحمد ورجاله رجال الصحيح غير أبي عبد الله الجدلي وهو ثقة”

“Ahmad ibn Hanbal” has quoted it and its narrators are the narrators of “Sahih Bukhari” except “Abi abd Allah al-Jadali” who is reliable.

“Al-Haythami”- Majma’ al-Zawa’id wa Manba’ al-f Fawa’id – vol. 9, p 130

“Abu Ya’li” and some of Sunni elders have quoted this narrative with authentic document and another sentence:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو خَيْثَمَةَ، حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُوسَى، حَدَّثَنَا عَيْسَى بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْبَجَلِيُّ، عَنِ
السُّدِّيِّ، عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْجَدَلِيِّ، قَالَ: قَالَتْ أُمُّ سَلَمَةَ: أَيَسَبُّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) عَلَيَّ
الْمَتَابِرِ؟ قُلْتُ: وَأَنْتِي ذَلِكَ؟ قَالَتْ: " أَلَيْسَ يُسَبُّ عَلَيَّ وَمَنْ يُحِبُّهُ؟ فَأَشْهَدُ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص)
كَانَ يُحِبُّهُ "

"Abu abd Allah jadali" says: "Umm Salama" said: is there anyone who puts curs on Prophet [PBUH] on top of the pulpit? I said: how is that possible? She said: isn't it true that they insult "Ali" and his supporters? I bear witness that prophet [PBUH] would like "Ali".

"Abu Ya'li" – Musnad Abu Ya'li – vol. 12 , p 444 /// "Al-Tabarani" – Al-Ruoz al-Dani {Mu'jam al-Saghir} – vol. 2, p 83 /// "Al-Tabarini" al-Mu'jam al-Kabir – vol. 23 , p 322 // "Al-Tabarani" – al-Mu'jam al-Awsat – vol. 6 , p 74 /// "Khatib Al-Baghdadi" – The History of Baghdad – vol. 7 , p 401 // "Ibn Kathir Damascene" – al-Bidaya wa'I- Nihaya – vol. 7, p 355

"Al-Haythami" says:

رواه الطبراني في الثلاثة وأبو يعلى ورجال الطبراني رجال الصحيح غير أبي عبدالله وهو
ثقة وروي الطبراني بعده بإسناد رجاله ثقات إلي أم سلمة عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم
قال مثله.

"Tabarani" has quoted this narrative in his three books and all the narrators of "Tabarani" are the narrators of "Sahih Bukhari" except "Abu Abd Allah" who is reliable.

"Al-Haythami" – Majma' al-Zawa'id wa'i-Manba' al-Fawa'id – vol. 9, p 130

"Hakim Nishapuri" has quoted this narrative with more details:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْحَافِطِ بَهْمَدَانَ، ثنا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُوسَى بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ التَّمِيمِيِّ، ثنا
جَنْدَلُ بْنُ وَالْقِي، ثنا بُكَيْرُ بْنُ عُمَانَ الْبَجَلِيُّ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ أَبَا إِسْحَاقَ التَّمِيمِيِّ، يَقُولُ: سَمِعْتُ
أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْجَدَلِيِّ، يَقُولُ: حَجَجْتُ وَأَنَا غُلَامٌ، فَمَرَرْتُ بِالْمَدِينَةِ وَإِذَا النَّاسُ عُنُقٌ وَاحِدٌ،

فَاتَّبَعْتُهُمْ، فَدَخَلُوا عَلَيَّ أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ زَوْجِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ، فَسَمِعْتُهَا تَقُولُ: يَا شَيْبَ بْنَ رُبَيْعٍ، فَأَجَابَهَا رَجُلٌ جِلْفٌ جَافٍ: لَبَّيْكَ يَا أُمَّتَاهُ، قَالَتْ: يُسَبُّ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي نَادِيكُمْ؟ قَالَ: وَأَنْبِي ذَلِكِ؟ قَالَتْ: فَعَلَيُّْ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ، قَالَ: إِنَّا لَنَقُولُ أَشْبَاءَ نُرِيدُ عَرَضَ الدُّنْيَا، قَالَتْ: فَإِنِّي سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: " مَنْ سَبَّ عَلِيًّا فَقَدْ سَبَّ نَبِيَّ، وَمَنْ سَبَّ نَبِيَّ فَقَدْ سَبَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى "

"Abu Abd Allah Jadali" says: I was a kid that I went to "Mecca" performing "Hajj". I met group of people in "Medina" and moved with them until we got to the house of "Umm Salama" the wife of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH], after we sat, "Umm Salama" said: O Shayb ibn Rub'I", he said:

O' mother! What do you say? She said: is that common thing amongst you to swear at Prophet [PBUH] after holding a ceremony? He answered: No it's never happened!

"Umm Salama" said: do you dispraise "Ali" [AS] in your ceremonies? He answered: we sometimes say bad things about him. "Umm Salama" said: I asked this question because I heard of messenger of god [PBUH] who said: those who swear at "Ali" [AS], they've sworn at me and those who insult me, they've insulted god.

"Al-Hakim Nishapuri" – Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p 130

Second narrative: "Qais ibn Hazim" from "Umm Salama":

(44318)- [267:42] أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ بْنُ طَاوُسٍ، أَنَا أَبُو الْفَتْحِ عَبْدُ الرَّزَّاقِ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْكَرِيمِ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْوَاحِدِ، أَنَا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ جَعْفَرِ الْجُرْجَانِيِّ، نَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَعْقُوبَ بْنَ يُوسُفَ الْأَصَمِّ، نَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ أَبِي الْحَنِينِ، نَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ أَبَانَ الْوَرَّاقُ، حَدَّثَنِي عَمْرُو، عَنْ إِسْمَاعِيلَ السُّدِّيِّ، قَالَ: وَقَالَ قَيْسُ بْنُ أَبِي حَازِمٍ: سَمِعْتُ أُمَّ سَلَمَةَ زَوْجَةَ النَّبِيِّ

(ص) تَقُولُ: " مَنْ سَبَّ عَلِيًّا وَأَجْبَاءَهُ فَقَدْ سَبَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) وَأَشْهَدُ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) كَانَ يُحِبُّهُ. "

"Qais ibn Hazim" said: I heard of "Umm Salama" who said: those who swear at "Ali ibn abi Talib" and his lovers, he has in fact sworn at messenger of god [PBUH] and I bear witness that prophet Muhammad [PBUH] would like "Ali ibn abi Talib".

"Ibn Asakir" – The history Damascus – vol. 42, p 267

"Umar ibn Shamruod" is in the document of this narrative and some of Sunni scholars have said that he's not reliable; however the document of the narrative is not authentic but it can confirm former narratives.

Third narrative: "Abd Allah bin Abbas"

"Shajari Jorjani" has quoted this issue from "Abd Allah bin Abbas" in "Amali" book:

(483)- [664] أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو أَحْمَدَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ الْمُؤَدَّبُ الْمَعْرُوفُ بِالْمَكْفُوفِ، بِقِرَاءَتِي عَلَيْهِ، قَالَ: أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ حَيَّانَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو سَعِيدٍ التَّمِيمِيُّ، جُنْدَارُ بْنُ وَائِقٍ، عَنْ حَمَّادٍ، عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ زَيْدٍ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ جُبَيْرٍ، قَالَ: بَلَغَ ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، أَنَّ قَوْمًا يَقْعُونَ فِي عَلِيِّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ، فَقَالَ لِابْنِهِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ: خُذْ بِيَدِي فَادْهَبْ بِي إِلَيْهِمْ، فَاخْذَ بِيَدِهِ حَتَّى انْتَهَى إِلَيْهِمْ فَقَالَ: أَيُّكُمْ السَّابُّ لِلَّهِ؟ قَالُوا: سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ مَنْ سَبَّ اللَّهَ فَقَدْ أَشْرَكَ، فَقَالَ: أَيُّكُمْ السَّابُّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ؟ قَالُوا: مَنْ سَبَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَقَدْ كَفَرَ، فَقَالَ: أَيُّكُمْ السَّابُّ لِعَلِيِّ؟ قَالُوا: قَدْ كَانَ ذَلِكَ، قَالَ فَاشْهَدُ لَسَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ، يَقُولُ: " مَنْ سَبَّ عَلِيًّا فَقَدْ سَبَّنِي، وَمَنْ سَبَّنِي فَقَدْ سَبَّ اللَّهَ، وَمَنْ سَبَّ اللَّهَ كَبَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَيَّ وَجْهَهُ فِي النَّارِ "

It's been quoted from "Sa'id ibn Jubayr": "Ibn Abbas" was told that some are insulting "Ali" [AS]. "Ibn Abbas" said to his son: hold my hand and take me to them, when they went to them, "Ibn Abbas" said: which one of you swore at god? They said: anyone who swears at god, he has become polytheist, then he said: which one of you has sworn at messenger of god [PBUH]? They said: anyone who insults Prophet [PBUH] he/she has become pagan. Then "Ibn Abbas" said: which one of you insulted "Ali"? They said: we did so. He said: I bear witness that I heard of Prophet [PBUH] who said: anyone who swears at "Ali" [AS], he's sworn at me, anyone who swears at me, he's sworn at god and anyone who insults god, god will throw him to the hell.

"Al-Shajari Jurjani" – Al-Amali – vol. 1, p 178 /// "Al-Tabari" – al-Zakha'ir al-Uqba – vol. 1, p 66

Fourth narrative: "Abd ar-Rahman bin Akhi bin Arqam:

"Ibn Asakir Damascene" has quoted two other narratives with such contents from "Abd ar-Rahman" who has quoted it from "Umm Salama":

«كَتَبَ إِلَيَّ أَبُو سَعْدٍ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ، وَأَبُو عَلِيٍّ الْحَسَنُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ، وَأَبُو الْقَاسِمِ غَانِمُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، ثُمَّ أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو الْمَعَالِيِّ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ الْخُلَوَائِيِّ، أَنَا أَبُو عَلِيٍّ، قَالُوا: أَنَا أَبُو نُعَيْمٍ الْحَافِظُ، نَا سُلَيْمَانَ بْنَ أَحْمَدَ، نَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْحَجَّاجِ بْنِ رَشْدِينَ، نَا يَوْسُفُ بْنُ عَدِيِّ الْكُوفِيِّ، نَا عَمْرُو بْنُ أَبِي الْمِقْدَامِ، عَنْ يَزِيدَ بْنِ أَبِي زِيَادٍ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ ابْنِ أَخِي زَيْدِ بْنِ أَرْقَمٍ، قَالَ: دَخَلْتُ عَلَيَّ أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ أُمِّ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، فَقَالَتْ: " مِنْ أَيْنَ أَنْتُمْ؟ " فَقُلْتُ: مِنْ أَهْلِ الْكُوفَةِ، فَقَالَتْ: " أَنْتُمْ الَّذِينَ تَشْتُمُونَ النَّبِيَّ (ص) فَقُلْتُ: مَا عَلِمْنَا أَحَدًا يَشْتُمُ النَّبِيَّ (ص) قَالَتْ: " بَلَى أَلَيْسَ يَلْعَنُونَ عَلِيًّا، وَيَلْعَنُونَ مَنْ يُحِبُّهُ؟ وَكَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) يُحِبُّهُ "»

“Abd ar-Rahman”, the son of the brother of “Zayd ibn Arqam” says: I went to “Umm Salama”? She said: where are you from? I said: I’m from “Kufa”. The she said: do you {people of Kufa} swear at Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]? I said: I don’t know anyone who insults Prophet [PBUH]. She said: that’s right, but don’t you put curse on “Ali” and those who like him? Despite of Prophet [PBUH] would like him.

“Ibn Asakir Dmascene”- vol. 2, p 266

“أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْفَرَاوِيُّ، أَنَا أَبُو عَثْمَانَ الْبَحِيرِيُّ، أَنَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ سُلَيْمِ النَّجَّادِ الْبَغْدَادِيِّ، نَا أَبُو الْعَبَّاسِ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سَعِيدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْهَمْدَانِيِّ، نَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى الصُّوفِيُّ، نَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ أَبَانَ الْوَرَّاقُ، نَا عَمْرُو بْنُ تَابِتٍ، عَنْ يَزِيدَ بْنِ أَبِي زِيَادٍ، حَدَّثَنِي ابْنُ أَخِي بْنِ أَرْقَمٍ، قَالَ: دَخَلْتُ عَلَيَّ أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ زَوْجِ النَّبِيِّ (ص) فَقَالَتْ: مِمَّنْ أَنْتَ؟ قُلْتُ: مِنْ أَهْلِ الْكُوفَةِ، قَالَتْ: مِنَ الَّذِينَ يُسَبُّ فِيهِمْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (ص) قُلْتُ: لَا وَاللَّهِ يَا أُمَّهُ، مَا سَمِعْتُ أَحَدًا يُسَبُّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (ص) قَالَتْ: بَلَى وَاللَّهِ إِنَّهُمْ يَقُولُونَ: فَعَلَ اللَّهُ بِعَلِيِّ، وَمَنْ يُحِبُّهُ، وَقَدْ كَانَ وَاللَّهِ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يُحِبُّهُ”

“Abd ar-Rahman” says: I went to “Umm Salama”, the wife of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH], she said: where are you from? I said: I’m from “Kufa”. She said: who swears at messenger of god [PBUH] in “Kufa”? I said: O’ mother! Swear by god, I didn’t hear anyone to insult prophet [PBUH]. She said: swear by god! I heard that they say: “may god do this and that to “Ali” and those who like him”, while messenger of god [PBUH] would like “Ali”.

“The history of Damascus” – v 42 – p 265

Conclusion:

This narrative has been quoted with two authentic documents and some other documents; thus there’s not any doubt in its validity.

According to this narrative anyone who swears at "Ali ibn abi Talib" [AS], he has sworn at messenger of god [PBUH] and in fact, he's sworn at god and swearing at god is polytheism.

From another side, as "Ibn Taymiyyah" has said, many of Sahaba would swear at "Ali ibn abi Talib".

So, where is that justice that Sunni scholars consider for each one of companions?

The End