

## Did “Umar Ibn Khattab” wish to have the virtues of commander of the faithful [AS]?

### Response:

This narrative has been quoted by “Ahmad ibn Hanbal” and other Sunni elders with different interpretations and numerous documents that the document of the narrative quoted by “Ahmad ibn Hanbal” and “Tahawi” is valid:

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ طَيْفُورٍ، قَتْنَا قُتَيْبَةَ، نَا يَعْقُوبُ، عَنِ سُهَيْلِ بْنِ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ،  
قَالَ:

«لَقَدْ أُوتِيَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ثَلَاثًا، لَأَنْ أَكُونَ أُوتِيْتُهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ إِعْطَاءِ حُمْرِ النَّعَمِ جِوَارِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ  
(ص) فِي الْمَسْجِدِ، وَالرَّايَةَ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرَ، وَالثَّلَاثَةَ نَسِيَهَا سُهَيْلٌ»

“Umar ibn Khattab” said: three qualities were given to “Ali ibn abi Talib” that if I had them it’d be better than to me having red-hair camels: being the neighbor of messenger of god [PBUH] in the mosque, giving flag to him on the day of “Ghadir”, third one has been forgotten by “Suhayl”.

“Ahmad ibn Hanbal” – Sahaba virtues – vol. 2, p 659 /// “al-Tahawi al-Hanafi”- Sharh Mushkil al-Athar, vol. 9, p 182-183

## Looking into the document of this narrative: {narrators}

“Ali ibn Tayfuor”:

علي بن طيفور بن غالب أبو الحسن النسوي... وكان ثقة.

“Ali ibn Tayfuor” was reliable

“Khatib Baghdadi”- The History of Baghdad – vol. 11, p 442

“Qutaybah ibn Sa’id ibn Jamil”:

He’s amongst the narrators of “Sahih Bukhari” and “Sahih Muslim”:

“قتيبة بن سعيد بن جميل بفتح الجيم بن طريف الثقفي أبو رجاء البغلاني... ثقة ثبت من العاشرة  
مات سنة أربعين عن تسعين سنة”

“Ibn Hajar Asqalani”- Taqrib al-Tahzib – vol. 1, p 454

“Ya’qub ibn Abd ar-Rahman”:

He’s amongst the narrators of “Sahih Bukhari” and “Sahih Muslim”:

“يعقوب بن عبد الرحمن بن محمد بن عبد الله بن عبد القاري بتشديد التحتانية المدني نزيل  
الإسكندرية حليف بني زهرة ثقة من الثامنة مات سنة إحدى وثمانين”

Taqrib al-Tahzib – vol. 1, p 608

“Suhayl ibn Zakwan”:

He’s amongst the narrators of “Sahih Bukhari” and “Sahih Muslim”:

سهيل بن أبي صالح ذكوان السمان ع أحد العلماء الثقات وغيره أقوى منه وقد روي عنه مالك قال  
البخاري سمعت عليا يقول كان قد مات له أخ فوجد عليه فنسي كثيرا من حديثه قال الحاكم قد يجد  
المتبحر في الصنعة ما ذكره علي أخرجه مسلم في الأصول وفي الشواهد.

"Zakwan ibn Sakih":

He's amongst the narrators of "Sahih Bukhari" and "Sahih Muslim":

"ذكوان أبو صالح السمان الزيات المدني ثقة ثبت وكان يجلب الزيت إلي الكوفة من الثالثة مات سنة  
إحدى ومائة"

"Taqrib al-Tahzib" – vol. 1, p 203

Thus, the document of this narrative is authentic and has no fault. It was written in this narrative that "Suhayl" has forgotten the third virtue; but this narrative has been quoted from him with another document in which he has said the third virtue and that's the marriage of commander of the faithful Ali [AS] with Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS].

"Tahawi" writes:

كَمَا قَدْ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ مَرْزُوقٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا رَوْحُ بْنُ أَسْلَمَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا  
سُهَيْلُ بْنُ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ، قَالَ: قَالَ عُمَرُ بْنُ الْخَطَّابِ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ  
عَنْهُ: " لَقَدْ أُعْطِيَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ خِصَالًا، لَأَنْ يَكُونَ فِيَّ خَصَلَةً مِنْهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ  
أَنْ أُعْطِيَ حُمْرَ النَّعَمِ ".

قَالُوا: وَمَا هُنَّ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ؟ قَالَ: " تَزَوَّجَ فَاطِمَةَ ابْنَةَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) وَسُكَّنَاهُ الْمَسْجِدَ مَعَ رَسُولِ  
اللَّهِ (ص) يَجِلُّ لَهُ فِيهِ مَا يَجِلُّ لِرَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) وَالرَّايَةُ يَوْمَ حَيْبَرَ ".

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ: وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ الَّذِي عَادَ إِلَيْهِ هَذَا الْحَدِيثُ، إِنْ يَكُنْ هُوَ الْمَخْرَمِيُّ، فَهُوَ مِمَّنْ يُحْمَدُ  
فِي حَدِيثِهِ، وَإِنْ يَكُنْ هُوَ ابْنُ نَجِيحٍ أَبُو عَلِيِّ ابْنِ الْمَدِينِيِّ، فَإِنَّ حَدِيثَهُ لَيْسَ كَحَدِيثِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ  
الْمَخْرَمِيِّ، وَلَكِنَّهُ لَيْسَ بِسَاقِطٍ، قَدْ حَدَّثَ النَّاسُ عَنْهُ، وَأَحَدٌ مَنْ حَدَّثَ عَنْهُ ابْنُهُ، وَهُوَ إِمَامٌ أَهْلُ الْحَدِيثِ.

“Abu Hurayrah” has quoted from “Umar Ibn Khattab” who said: “Ali ibn abi Talib” [AS] has three qualities that if I had one of them I’d would better for me than having red-hair camels. They asked: what are those qualities? “Umar” said: marrying the daughter of messenger of god [PBUH], living in the mosque with Prophet [PBUH] and that anything that was “Halal” for Prophet, that was “Halal” for “Ali” either, giving flag to “Ali” in the battle of “Khaybar”.

“Abu Ja’far” {author} says: “Abdullah ibn Ja’far” whose name is written in the document of narrative, if he is “Abdullah ibn Ja’far makhrami”, he’s amongst those who have been praised in quoting narrative; but if he is “Abdullah ibn Ja’far ibn Najij” known as “Ali ibn Madini”, his narrative isn’t rejected however, his hadith is not as valuable as the hadith quoted by “Abdullah ibn Ja’far Makhrami”, people have quoted narrative from him that one of them is his son who is the Imam of Hadith narrators.

“Al-Tahawi” – Sharh Mushkil al-Athar- vol. 3, p 135

After quoting this narrative, “Hakim Nishapuri” says:

“هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه”

This narrative is authentic; but “Bukhari” and “Muslim” have not quoted it.

“Al-Hakim Nishapuri” – Al-mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain – vol. 3, p 135

“Jalal al-Din Suyuti” and “Ibn Hajar Asqalani” write:

“واخرج أبو يعلي عن أبي هريرة قال قال عمر بن الخطاب لقد أعطي علي ثلاث خصال لأن تكون لي خصلة منها أحب إلي من أن أعطي حمر النعم فستل وما هن قال تزوجه ابنته فاطمة وسكناه المسجد لا يحل لي فيه ما يحل له والراية يوم خيبر.

وروي أحمد بسند صحيح عن ابن عمر نحوه”

"Abu Ya'li" has quoted via "Abu Hurayrah" that "Umar ibn Khattab" said: "Ali" [AS] was given three qualities that if I had one of them, it'd be better to me than having red-hair camels. He was asked: what are those qualities: he said: he married the daughter of messenger of god [PBUH], Prophet Muhammad let him living in mosque with him but It was not permissible to me living in mosque and giving flag to "Ali" [AS] on the day of "Khaybar".

"Ahmad" has quoted this narrative in another way from "Abdullah Ibn Umar" with authentic document.

"Al-Suyuti" – The history of caliphs- vol. 1, p 172 /// "Al-Haythami" – "Al-Sawa'iq al-Muhriqa – vol. 2, p 373

The End