

Why did Prophet [PBUH] not introduce "Ali" to people in "Mecca" or "Arafat?"

Description:

Above doubt that has been discussed by "Ibn Taymiyyah" wants to say that if Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] wanted to introduce commander of the faithful Ali [AS] as the next caliph, he could have done so in a place with more people such as: "Mecca" or "Arafat" desert. Thus, what happened in "Ghadir" is not that Shias claim.

The main doubt of "Ibn Tymiyyah" is as follow:

أن الذي جري يوم الغدير لم يكن مما أمر بتبليغه، كالذي بلغه في حجة الوداع؛ فإن كثيراً من الذين حجوا معه - أو أكثرهم - لم يرجعوا معه إلى المدينة، بل رجع أهل مكة إلى مكة، وأهل الطائف إلى الطائف، وأهل اليمن إلى اليمن، وأهل البوادي الغربية من ذاك إلى بواديهم. وإنما رجع [معه] أهل المدينة ومن كان قريباً منها

Minhaj al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah – vol. 7 – p 315 – 317

And amongst things that show that what happened in "Ghadir" was not what Prophet had to proselyte it, is that many of people who had gone to "Mecca" alongside prophet to perform "Hajj" didn't get back to "Medina"; but some who were from "Mecca" remained there and some who were from "Ta'if" went to "Ta'if" directly and some would go to "Yemen", {not of them went through "Ghadir" region to hear what Prophet [PBUH] says}

So if Prophet Muhammad wanted to announce the Imamate of "Ali" should have said it in "farewell Hajj" {last hajj of Prophet}, so, now that he didn't do so and didn't say anything related to the Imamate of "Ali" and no one has quoted any narrative in this regard, neither invalid nor valid narrative, and even Prophet [PBUH] has not said the name of "Ali" in his

sermon while it was public gathering that all pilgrims were there, we can understand that Prophet wasn't in order to announce the Imamate of "Ali".

Response:

1: messenger of god [PBUH] is obedient to revelation:

Prophet [PBUH] is obedient to revelation and because verse of "convey" was sent down in "Ghadir", he is responsible to allocate that place to this matter. In continue we'll say Sunni a narrative written in Sunni resources that shows that the verse of "convey" and "perfection" was sent down in "Ghadir":

نزلت هذه الآية: «يا أيها الرسول بلغ ما أنزل إليك من ربك» علي رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم يوم غدير خم في علي بن أبي طالب

This verse "O Messenger, deliver what is sent down to you from your Lord; if you do not, you will not have conveyed His Message. Allah protects you from the people. Allah does not guide the nation, the unbelievers" was revealed to Prophet [PBUH] in "GHadir Khumm" about "Ali ibn abi Talib" [AS].

When the cause of the revelation of the verse of "convey" in "Ghadir Khumm" and the guardianship of commander of the faithful Ali [AS] were proved as Sunni resources confirm such thing, so, the concept of what Shias claim is proved and also liar is known and then we should say "The guardianship of Ali ibn abi Talib" has been proved".

2: all seditions will arise from "Medina:"

The problem which could happen for the caliphate and Imamate of commander of the faithful Ali [AS] could be made by "Quraysh" Muslims and people of "Medina" {as it

occurred after Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] died} and not by the Muslims who live in faraway lands such as Muslims in "Ta'if" and "Yemen" or other places .

"Bukhari" says about prophet [PBUH]'s forecast regarding seditions that will occur in "Medina" after him:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو نُعَيْمٍ، حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ عُيَيْنَةَ، عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ، عَنِ عُرْوَةَ، عَنِ أَسَامَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ
أَشْرَفَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَلَيَّ أَطْمَ مِنْ الْأَطَامِ، فَقَالَ هَلْ تَرَوْنَ مَا أَرَى إِيَّيَ أَرَى
الْفِتْنَ تَقَعُ خِلَالَ بُيُوتِكُمْ مَوَاقِعَ الْقَطْرِ

Sahih Bukhari – vol. 4 – p 176

Messenger of god went on top of a high hill around "Medina" and said: are you seeing what I'm seeing? I see that seditions shower from amongst your houses {people of Medina} like rain.

"Al-Nuwi" says about above sentence written in "Sahih Bukhari:"

... والتشبيه بمواقع القطر في الكثرة والعموم أي أنها كثيرة وتعم الناس لا تختص بها
طائفة وهذا إشارة الي الحروب الجارية بينهم كوقعه الجمل وصفين والحرة ومقتل عثمان
ومقتل الحسين رضي الله عنهما وغير ذلك وفيه معجزة ظاهرة له صلى الله عليه وسلم

"Nuwi" – Sharh Sahih Muslim – vol. 18 – p 7

The simile of messenger of god [PBUH] which is amongst his miracles isn't for special clan in "Medina"; but this saying mentions to wars between people of "Medina" such as: battle of "Badr", "Seffin", "Hurrah" and...

"Ibn Hajar" says about this saying of prophet [PBUH]:

... اني لاري الفتن خلال بيوتكم وكان خطابه ذلك لاهل المدينة

Prophet Muhammad is addressing people of “Medina.”

3:“Mina” and “Arafat”, unsuitable for introducing commander of the faithful Ali

[AS]

Note: {Mina is a neighborhood of Mecca in Makkah Province, in western Saudi Arabia}

وعن ابن عباس : لما أمر النبي (صلي الله عليه وآله وسلم) أن يقوم بعلي ابن أبي طالب المقام الذي قام به؛ فانطلق النبي (صلي الله عليه وآله وسلم) إلي مكّة، فقال: رأيت الناس حديثي عهد بكفر- بجاهلية - ومتي أفعال هذا به، يقولوا: صنع هذا بابن عمّه ثم مضي حتي قضى حجة الوداع.[6]

“Ibn Abbas” says: since messenger of god was ordered to appoint “Ali” [AS] as his successor, he went to “Mecca” {but he didn’t do that in there} and said that signs of blasphemy {and ignorance} are still in people and if I appoint “Ali” as my successor, they’ll say that I’m doing it because of cousin. That’s why he refused doing so and appointed “Ali” [AS] as his successor when he was returning from “farewell Hajj.”

On the other hand “Mina” and “Arafat” or “Mecca” province are places that during their presence in there, people focus on worshiping and doing deeds which are special for those places and any kind of program in these places will either distract people who are worshiping or will remove the particular importance of that matter.

Before the caravan of “farewell Hajj” moves, it was announced in “Medina” that Prophet [PBUH] is going to Mecca performing “Hajj” ritual to train “Ahkam” and mores of “Hajj.”

عن حذيفة: أمر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله المؤذنين، فأذنوا في أهل السافلة
والعالية: ألا إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله قد عزم علي الحج في عامه هذا ليفهم
الناس حجهم ويعلمهم مناسكهم ، فيكون سنة لهم إلي آخر الدهر...

Irshad al-Quluob – p 328 / Bihar al-Anwar- vol. 28, p 95 and 155

Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] ordered "Mu'azzins" {A muezzin is the person appointed at a mosque to lead and recite the call to prayer for every event of prayer and worship in the mosque} to announce in all cities and lands that prophet [PBUH] is going to go to "Hajj" in this year and the target of this "Hajj" is training the deeds and mores of "Hajj" until this mores remains amongst people for ever...

Ground was so prepared in "Ghadir" that people who were in "Ghadir" came further and swore allegiance with commander of the faithful Ali [AS] and congratulated him and recorded this event in the History in front of all people in there as a lasting document.

The End