

## The martyrdom of Hadrat "Fatimah" {AS}

### Mr. "Yasini":

Wahhabis say: martyrdom of Hadrat Fatimah {AS} is a legend and she wasn't martyred and died of natural causes.

### Master "Qazvini":

They made such doubt when parliament of Iran approved that the day of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom is official holiday. And when they saw that "Fatimiyyah" days {days in which Shias mourn Hadrat "Fatimah"} are held with utmost glory every year, it was intolerable for Wahhabis and some ultra Sunnis, that's why they began creating this doubt on their satellite channels, different web sites, Friday prayers that martyrdom of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] is nothing other than a legend. Even one of the famous Sunni Friday prayer leaders in Iran, swore by god that enmity relationship between commander of the faithful [AS] and caliphs that Shias quote is a lie.

If there is narrative which says that Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] died of natural causes, show it to us.

Last year I attended a T.V program that aired on "Al-Mustaqillah" channel, this channel belongs to Wahhabism and "Saudi Arabia pays its expenditures, on that program, I proved with authentic-document narratives that Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom, breaking into her house, breaking her side and aborting her child are all true and Sunni valid books have quoted all of them with authentic document, such as: "Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir" from "Tabarani" and "The History of Islam" from "Al-Dhahabi". As Sunnis know "Al-Dhahabi" is amongst most famous Sunni scholars. He usually doesn't quote narratives that aren't compatible with Sunni beliefs, especially, if those narrative don't contain good things about caliphs {Abu-Bakr- Umar-Uthman} and if he quotes them, he finds fault with them and reject them. Even if he doesn't have scientific reason to reject narratives about "Ahl al-Bayt" [AS]'s virtues or narratives in which caliphs are dispraised, he says:

"يشهد القلب أنه باطل"

My heart bears witness that this narrative is not valid.

It means if his heart says that a narrative is not valid, it's not valid even if all its narrators are reliable and its document is valid. Despite this quality, Mr."Al-Dahabi" has quoted narrative related to Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom and assaulting her house admitted by first caliph in the book "The History of Islam", v 3, p 177, without finding fault with it.

Mr."Tabarani" quotes this narrative in the book "Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir", v 1, p 62, the text of narrative is long. "Abu-Bakr" said to Sahaba in the last moments of his life:

I didn't do some works while I was interested in doing them and I did some works that I regret doing them and feel sorry.

Amongst works that "Abu-Bakr" said I regret doing them, was assaulting the house of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS], he said:

إني لا آسى علي شئ إلا علي ثلاث فعلتھن، وددت أني لم أفعلھن و ثلاث لم أفعلھن  
وددت أني فعلتھن و ثلاث وددت أني سألت رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم عنھن، فأما  
الثلاث اللاتي وددت أني لم أفعلھن: فوددت أني لم أكن كشفت بيت فاطمة و تركته و أن  
أغلق علي الحرب ... .

There are three things that I did and I regret doing them, I wish I didn't do them ... I wish I didn't order attacking Fatimah's house and I wish I didn't fight Fatimah's ancestry.

"Al-Haythamy", majma' al-Zawaed, v 2, p 202 /// "Ibn Abi'l-Hadid"- description of Nahj al-Balagha, v 2, p 46 /// "Ibn Asakir", The History of Damascus, v 30, p 418 /// "the History of Tabari", v 2, p 619

It means that first caliph considers assaulting Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s house and breaking into her house as fighting. This is what Sunni elders have quoted. Mr."Diya al-Din al-Maqdisi" -who was Hanbali Scholar and "Al-Dhahabi" says about him:

"الإمام العالم الحافظ الثقة الحجة عالم بالرجال"

He's Imam, reliable, retentive, and his saying is proof and he knows "Rejal" science.

"Al-Dhahabi"- Tazkirat al-Huffaz, v 4, p 1405

- says after this narrative:

"هذا حديث حسن عن أبي بكر"

This narrative in which "Abu-Bakr" confesses is authentic.

"Al-Ahadith Mukhtarah", v 10, p 88-90

And Mr."Al-Suyuti" restates in the book "Musnad Fatimah", p 34 that this narrative is authentic.

Amongst big scholars of "Saudi Arabia", "Hassan bin Farhan Maliki" says:

**"إذن هي ثابتة بأسانيد صحيحة، بل هي ذكري مؤلمة"**

The narrative of assaulting Fatimah's house has been quoted with authentic document, and this a painful incident.

"Ibn Taymiyyah"- Wahhabism big theoretician- can't be indifferent about multiple narratives related to assaulting the house of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] and says:

**"غاية ما يقال: إنه كبس البيت، لينظر هل فيه شئ من مال الله الذي يقسمه"**

"Abu-Bakr" and "Umar" broke into Fatimah's house to see if there is anything in her house from public treasury dividing amongst people.

I don't know where he has gotten this sentence from that they broke into Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s house to confiscate her property dividing amongst people. Did Umar himself say so? Or historians have quoted it or a Sunni scholar has said so? How is that "ibn Taymiyyah" discovers such thing in eighth century AH that second caliph's target was of assaulting was to see if there is money there dividing amongst people?

"Ibn abi Shaybah", "Tabari" and "Al-Bladhury" have quoted many narratives and restate that "Umar" {second caliph} stood behind the door of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s house and said:

Swear by god! If you don't come for allegiance, I'll burn the house with people inside.

Mr."Juwaini"- the master of "Al-Dhahabi" that "Dhahabi" says about him:

**"الإمام المحدث الأوحى الأكمل فخر الإسلام"**

He's imam, narrator, has highest perfections and Islam is proud of him.

"Al-Dhahabi", Tazkira al-Huffaz, v 4, 1505

- has quoted a narrative from prophet [PBUH] in the book "Fara'id al-Simtayn", v 2, p 34:

After me, they will break Fatimah's side and cause her "Muhsen" to get aborted and "Fatimah" will come to me:

**"مغمومة مغصوبة مقتولة"**

While she's sad and they've usurped her due and martyred her

Mr."Shahrastani" quotes from "Nazzam"- who is amongst big Sunni scholars and "Mu'tazilite":

**"إن عمر ضرب بطن فاطمه عليها السلام يوم البيعة حتى القت الجنين من بطنها و كان يصيح احرقوا دارها بمن فيها و ما كان في الدار غير علي و فاطمة و الحسن و الحسين"**

On the day of allegiance, second caliph kicked Fatimah's belly strongly that child in her belly was aborted. "Umar" shouted: burn the house of "Fatimah" with all its occupants, while there was no one in her house other than "Ali", "Fatimah", "Hassan" and "Hussein".

**"Al-Shahrastani", Al-Milal wa Al-Nihal, v 1, p 57**

Are these Shias' sayings? Mr."Shahrastani" died in 548 AH. The matters of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom, fetus abortion, breaking her side have been quoted in Shia and Sunni history. So we can't say it's a legend. Yes, I say as well that I wish it was a legend! I wish they didn't assault Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s house! I wish it hadn't happened and the heart of prophet [PBUH]'s daughter had been broken and I wish that this heart-rending incident that made Hadrat "Ali" [AS] to shed tear hadn't happened. but it happened and this black event was recorded in the history.

**Mr."Yasini":**

Wahhabis have made doubt that why did commander of the faithful [AS] let some assaulting the house and beat hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] up and he didn't do anything despite his courage?

**"Master Qazvini":**

Yes, we believe as well that commander of the faithful [AS]'s courage was the mouth of public. Second caliph said:

**”لو لا سيف علي لما قام عمود الإسلام“**

If Ali’s sword were not, the flag of Islam wouldn’t rise.

But dear viewers should pay attention, in the matter of assaulting “Ali” [AS] and “Fatimah” [AS]’s house, Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] was sitting beside front door and commander of the faithful [AS], “Zubayr” and some of guys from “Banu Hashim” {it’s one of the clans of the Quraysh tribe} were in the room talking. “Abu-Bakr” was notified that they’re plotting and want to over throw you. “Abu-Bakr” ordered second caliph to go and bring “Ali” to the mosque for allegiance whatever it takes. When they got close to the house, Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] saw them and closed the door, “Umar” shouted and said:

**”يا فاطمة! افتحي الباب“**

Open the door.

Hadrat “Fatimah” didn’t open the door.

Maybe these events happened in only one minute, they broke the door and door hit Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS]. These things are written in our authentic resources.

When commander of the faithful “Ali” [AS] come out of room, he saw that Hadrat “Fatimah” [AS] has fallen on the ground near the front door and her side is broken and she was beaten up:

**”فوثب علي و أخذ بتلابيبه، ثم نتره فصرعه و وجأ أنفه و رقبتة و همّ بقتله، فذكر قول رسول الله صلي الله عليه و آله و ما أوصاه به“**

“Ali” went to Umar quickly, got his belt and hit him on the ground strongly and hit his neck and nose, then he remembered prophet [PBUH]’s will, he had said: if you want Islam to exist and my name remains eternal, you should avoid using your sword and fighting them.

That’s why commander of the faithful Ali [AS] said to “Umar”:

**”و الذي كرم محمدا بالنبوة! يا بن صهاك! لولا كتاب من الله سبق و عهد عهده إلي رسول الله صلي الله عليه و آله لعلمت إنك لا تدخل بيتي“**

Swear by god who cherished prophet [PBUH] by giving prophecy to him, O son of “Sahhak”! If it weren’t for divine order and prophet [PBUH]’s will, you’d find out that you didn’t have the power of coming to my house.

The book of Sulayman bin Qays, searched by Muhammad Ansari, p 150

M.r "Ālūsī" - Sunni and wahhabism big scholar- quotes it in his "Tafsir" book:

When "Fatimah" was stranded between door and wall and was beaten up:

“و صاحت يا أبتاه و يا رسول الله، فرفع عمر السيف و هو في غمده فوجأ به جنبها المبارك و رفع السوط فضرب به ضرعها فصاحت يا أبتاه، فأخذ علي بتلابيب عمر و هزه و وجأ أنفه و رقبتة”

She shouted: O messenger of god! "Umar" hit her side by sword that was in the sheath and whipped her, Fatimah shouted: O father! "Ali" got Umar's belt and hit him on the ground and hit his neck and nose.

"Tafsir 'Alusi", v 3, p 124

Ālūsī quotes it without finding fault with or rejecting it.

So those who say that why "Ali" [AS] didn't defend his wife and ... should take a look at these narratives.

### **Second point:**

Commander of faithful [AS] said:

Prophet [PBUH] willed me not to fight or kill in this regard.

### **Third point:**

If commander of the faithful [AS] would fight them back, they'd defend themselves, fighting would occur and Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS], Imam Hasan [AS] and Imam Husayn [AS] would definitely be killed by them, if it had happened wouldn't have these guys said that Hadrat "Ali" [AS] is the murderer of imam "Hasan" [AS] and Imam "Husayn" [AS]? prophet [PBUH] said about "Ammar":

“تقتله الفئة الباغية، يدعوهم الي الجنة و يدعوهم إلي النار”

"Ammar" is killed by oppressor group. "Ammar" invites them to the paradise and that oppressor group invites him to the fire.

Sahih Bukhari, v3, p 297 // Sahih Muslim, v 8, p 18

“Ahmad bin Hanbal” quotes in his book:

When “Ammar” was killed, some of the leaders of Muawiyah’s army stopped fighting and said to “Muawiyah”: we no longer fight. “Muawiyah” said: why? They said: because prophet [PBUH] said that “Ammar” is killed by oppressor group and it was proved that we’re oppressor group. “Amr bin al-‘As” said: some of leaders stopped fighting. “Muawiyah” said:

“دحضت في بولك، أو نحن قتلناه؟ إنما قتله علي و أصحابه جاؤوا به حتي ألقوه بين  
رماحنا أو بين سيوفنا”

Did we kill “Ammar”? His murderers were “Ali” and companions of “Ali” who made him coming here fighting us.

“Musnad Ahmad bin Hnabal”, v 4, p 199 /// “Al-Bayhaqi”, Sunan al-Kubra, v 8, p 189 /// “Al-Dhahabi”, Seir al-A’lam al-Nubala” /// “Ibn Asakir”, history of Damascus, v 43, p 431///“Musnad Abu Ya’la” v 13, p 124 and ...

I ask those who call “Muawiyah”: Hadrat “Muawiyah” and praise him to take look at this narrative and reconsider.

“Ahmad bin Hanbal” says:

Any narrative that you don’t find it in my book is not authentic. any narrative which has been valid in my opinion, I’ve written it in this book.

“Manawi”- who is among Sunni scientific pillars- says:

“Ali” was notified that “Muawiyah” says: the murderer of “Ammar” was “Ali” and oppressor group is Ali’s army, “Ali” said:

“بأن رسول الله صلي الله عليه و سلم إذن قتل حمزة حين أخرجه”

So the murderer of “Hmazah” is prophet [PBUH] who took him out of home and put before “Quraysh” sword.

“Al-Manawi” Feiz al-Ghadir, v 6, p 474

**Fourth point:**

You who say that commander of the faithful [AS] was the conquerer of the battles of "Badr", "Uhud" and "Hunayn" and his sword at the age of prophet [PBUH] was in mouth of public and second caliph says:

**"والله! لو لا سيف علي لما قام عمود الإسلام"**

Swear by god if it weren't for Ali's sword, Islam flag wouldn't raise.

**"Ibn Abi'l-Hadid", comments on the peak of Eloquence, v 12, 82**

We ask you Sunnis and Wahhabis, why didn't Hadrat "Ali" [AS] uses his sword during those 25 years that "Abu-Bakr", "Umar" and Uthman" were caliph? What had happened to his courage? Why didn't he attend none of battles? Had he lost his courage or his sword wasn't sharp? Or he didn't believe that caliphs' caliphate is legitimate and their conquers are Islamic? Because prophet [PBUH] didn't will to do so and at the time of prophet [PBUH] they wouldn't conquer countries, that's why commander of the faithful [AS] chose silence and by proving his innocence – and Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] with her deeds- showed that caliphs' caliphate is not legitimate and proved their rightfulness and innocence as best as possible.

**Mr. "Yasini":**

They made this doubt that why when Hadrat "Ali" [AS] was at home, Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] went opening the door on non-relatives?

**Master "Qazvini":**

These doubt that you said, they discuss it on Wahhabism channels and websites saying that it's against a man's zeal that he sits in the room and his spouse opens the door on people, non-relatives in particular.

**Firstly:**

It's written in Shia authentic books such as: "Tafsir al-'Ayyashi", v 2, p 67 and "Bihar al-Anwar", v 28, p 227 from Allamah "Majlisi", and the book "Al-Ikhtisas", v 2, p 93 from Shaikh "al-Mufid" that Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] was sitting in front of the door and "Umar" has quoted:



“فلما انتهينا إلي الباب فرأتهم فاطمة صلوات الله عليها أغلقت الباب في وجوههم و هي لا تشك أن لا يدخل عليها إلا بأذنهما، فضرب عمر الباب برجله فكسره و كان من سعف، ثم دخلوا...”

When we got to the house, Fatimah saw us and closed the door and she didn't doubt that they don't enter the house without Fatimah's permission. "Umar" kicked the door and broke it and they went to the house.

### Thirdly:

Commander of the faithful [AS] and Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] were sure that they don't enter the house without permission, they believed that they've definitely read this Quran verse:

“يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بُيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَ تَسَلِّمُوا عَلَى أَهْلِهَا ذَلِكُمْ خَيْرٌ لَكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَذَكَّرُونَ”

Believers, do not enter houses other than your houses until you first ask permission and greet with peace the people thereof; that is better for you in order that you remember.

Sura AL-NOOR/ verse 27

Or this verse:

“فِي بُيُوتٍ أُذِنَ لِلَّهِ أَنْ تُرْفَعَ وَ يُذَكَرَ فِيهَا اسْمُهُ يُسَبِّحُ لَهُ فِيهَا بِالْغُدُوِّ وَ الْأَصَالِ”

“In houses which Allah has allowed to be raised up, and His Name to be remembered therein. In the morning and evening

Sura AL-NOOR/ verse 36

“Suyuti” quotes that when prophet [PBUH] read this verse:

“فقام اليه رجل، فقال: أي بيوت هذه يا رسول الله؟ قال: بيوت الأنبياء، فقام اليه أبو بكر، فقال: يا رسول الله! هذا البيت منها لبيت علي و فاطمة؟ قال: نعم، من أفاضلها”

A man got up and said: O messenger of god! What houses does this verse mean? He said: prophets [PBUT]'s house. "Abu-Bakr" got up and said: O messenger of god! Does Ali and Fatimah's house contain prophets [PBUTH]'s house? He said: yes it doses. But it's amongst the best house of prophets [PBUTH].

"Al-Suyuti", Al-Durr al-Manthur, v 5, p 50, "Hakim Haskani", Shawahid al-Tanzil, v 1, p 534  
/// "Tafsir Alusi", v 18, p 174

That's why commander of the faithful [AS] believed that they'll consider the house of "Ali" [AS] and "Fatimah" [AS] as prophets [PBUH]'s house. Their house has especial esteem and if even someone wants to go to non-prophets house should ask permission.

#### **Fourthly:**

Those Wahhabis who say that Hadrat "Ali" [AS] was at home, so why did Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] open the door? It's written in your own books that "Ibn Isa" quotes:

On a day "Ali bin abi-Talib" knocked the door of prophet [PBUH]'s house, prophet said to "Umm Salama":

"قومي فافتحي له"

Go and open the door.

"Ibn Asakir", the history of Medina, v 42, p 471 /// "Al-Khwarizmi", Manāqib, p 87

So prophet [PBUH] says to "Umm Salama", get up and open the door. is that – refuge to god- against man's zeal that a man sits at home and says to his spouse opening the door?, what do you call it?

#### **Fifthly:**

"قرع عمر بن الخطاب الباب و قال: افتحي يا خديجه"

"Umar" knocked the door of prophet [PBUH]'s house. Prophet [PBUH] said: O "Khadija"! Open the door.

"Suyuti", Jami' al-Ahadith, v 36, p 345// Hadith No. 39496// "Ibn Asakir", the history of Damascus, v 44, p 35

What do you say about it?! Do you dare to say that prophet [PBUH] didn't have zeal?

#### **Sixthly:**

It's written in some books:

On a day in "Median", commander of the faithful [AS] knocked the door of prophet [PBUH]'s house and "Ayesha" said:

"من هذا؟ أنا علي"

Who is that? He said: it's me "Ali".

Prophet [PBUH] heard Ali's sound and said to "Ayesha":

"يا عايشه! افتحي له الباب"

O "Ayesha"! Open the door.

"Tabrisi", Al-Ihtijaj, v 1, p 292 /// "Allamah Majlisi", "Bihar al-Anwar", v 38, 348

Do Sunnis say in here as well that why prophet [PBUH] said to "Ayesha" opening the door?!

### **Seventhly:**

Those who say that a woman shouldn't open the door on non-relative man, and this act is incompatible with chastity and against man's zeal, have quoted in their books:

"مرّ عمر برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وهو وعائشة وهما يأكلان حيسا، فدعاه فوضع يده، مع أيديهما، فأصابت يده يد عائشة، فقال: أوه، لو أطاع في هذه و صواحبه ما رأتهن أعين"

Once "Umar" went to prophet [PBUH]'s house and saw prophet [PBUH] and "Ayesha" eating food. "Umar" used the same food bowl as them, while getting food from the bowl his hand ran into Ayesha's hand. "Umar" said: if prophet [PBUH] listened to me and kept his wives behind the curtain. No one would see "Ayesha" and his other wives.

"Ibn Abī Shaiba", "Musnaf", v 7, p 485 /// "Al-Haythami", Majma' al-Zawa'id, v 7, p 93//  
"Tafsir ibn Abi Hatim", v 10, p 48

Now, how is it that you say that Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] opened the door on non-relatives and it's against chastity and zeal, but if "Umar" eats food with prophet [PBUH] and "Ayesha" and his hand runs into Ayesha's hand, it's not against chastity and zeal!

When these guys say such things, we have no choice unless to talk about it explicitly and reveal hidden history and remove the curtain from the facts covered during these 15 centuries so that Sunni, Wahhabi and Shia youth know what has happened in the history.

### Mr. "Yasisni":

They made this doubt that at that time houses in "Medina" didn't have door at all, so door wasn't hit Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s side. Please tell us your reasons rejecting this doubt.

### Master "Qazvini":

Those who say such things are apparently unaware of the history and haven't seen their own narratives.

"Abu Dawood" quotes in his book named "Sunan", v 2, p 527:

One of companions came to prophet [PBUH]'s chamber and asked him something. Prophet [PBUH] said to "Umar": take this key, go to my house and give him money.

**"فأخذ المفتاح من حجرته ففتح"**

He got the key and opened the door of Prophet [PBUH]'s house.

If homes didn't have door, so why prophet gave the key to him, those who say that there was mat and curtain not door in front of houses, do people lock the curtain and mat?! Do mat and curtain need to be opened by key? It shows that these guys don't know about the History.

It's written in the book "Shih Muslim", v 6, p105, Hadith No. 5136:

**"و بالأبواب أن تغلق ليلا"**

People of "Medina" were ordered to close the door of their houses at night.

"Ibn Kathir Damascus" quotes in the book "Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya", v 3, p 268:

**"كانت حجره من شعر مربوطة بخشب من عرعر"**

The door of prophet [PBUH]'s house was made of cypress.

"Bukhari" quotes in the book "Al-Adab Al-Mufrad":

One of companions asked: which side of the mosque is Ayesha's house located? He said: in the south of the mosque and its door opens towards north.

**"فقلت: مصراعا او مصراعين؟ قال: كان بمصرع واحد. قال: من أي شيء كان؟ قال: كان باب بيت عائشة من عرعر أو ساج"**

He said: What was Ayesha's house made of? He said: I was made of cypress.

"Al-Bukhari", al- Adab al-Munfarid, v 1, p 272

There are many narratives in this regard that house in "Medina" had door and most of them were made of cypress. "Ali" [AS]'s house had door as well made of palm stems. This fact is recorded in the history, but they don't pay attention, thus they say baseless, irrelevant words.

### **Viewers' question:**

1: I'm Shia. Mr."Qazvini" said: Hadrat "Ali" [AS] didn't draw sword on them and didn't have right to do so, why don't you say its real Hadith?

### **Response:**

I bear witness that he's not Shia. Because a Shia doesn't talk like that, because each guy has a culture and speaking manner,

Commander of the faithful [AS] would think of this saying of prophet [PBUH]:

**ان وجدت ناصرا فقاتلهم و إلا فالصق كلكك علي الأرض**

"if you can find some to help you, fight these guys, otherwise stay at home.

"Ibn abi'al-Hadid", description of Nahj al-Balagha, v 20, p 326

As prophet [PBUH] didn't draw sword against opponents' assaults during his 13-year presence in Mecca, commander of the faithful [AS] didn't do so following prophet [PBUH], because he didn't have force to help him.

### **Question:**

How is it that the named 4-5 month-old baby "Muhsen"? If he were born, what social position would he have? Would he become like "Abu-Bakr bin Ali" or "Umar bin Ali"?

### **Response:**

Refer to Sunni books, we've found about 40 Sunni books in which it's been proved that the fifth child of Hadrat "Fatimah" was "Muhsen" and prophet [PBUH] himself named him "Muhsen". It's written in narrative when child's fetus is made in mother's womb select a

name for child. If you don't do so and child gets aborted, that child will complain of you to God on the day of resurrection. This is prophet [PBUH]'s order.

Mr. "Masudi Shafi'i" quotes in the book "Ethbat al-Wasiyyah", p 143

**"و ضغطوا سيدة النساء في الباب حتي أسقطت محسنا"**

They put Fatimah between the door and wall so that her "Muhsen" was aborted.

"Al-Sabki", al-Tabaqat al-Shafi'iyah, v 3, p 456 /// "Al-Dhahabi" seir al-A'lam al-Nubala', v 15, p 578 /// "Al-Shahrestani, Al-Milal wa Al-Nihal, v 5, p 347

**Question:**

After Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom, when Umar became caliph, why did Hadrat "Ali" cooperate with him? "Umar" even said several times "if it were not for "Ali", "Umar" would perish", especially in judgments.

**Response:**

I said in previous sessions that commander of the faithful [AS] -as Imam- has duties and amongst his tasks, are saying Islamic affairs and protecting Shari'a and distortion and establishing justice. If even Islamic ruler is Jewish and commander of the faithful [AS] is in that government, when he sees that justice wasn't served in judgment and an innocent guy is stoned, commander of the faithful [AS] goes there as his religious obligation not to cooperate with that ruler.

**Question:**

At the time of two first caliphs, some countries were conquered and some companions attended these battles, if they believed that Hadrat "Ali" [AS] is the caliph, so why did they cooperate with them?

**Response:**

Commander of the faithful Ali [AS] ordered them. Some religious resources say as well that they found out that if they don't cooperate in some affairs, their life will be disturbed and perhaps, way is paved for their murdering. Some of the companions of commander of the faithful [AS] cooperated with them out of fear and that Imam "Hasan" [AS] would

cooperate with the government in some battles and affairs is a clear lie. There isn't any valid or invalid narrative in this regard. And anyone –Sunni or Shia- who says so is liar.

**Question:**

Why did Hadrat "Ali" give his daughter to "Umar bin al-Khattab"?

**Response:**

I've already explained about it comprehensively.

**Firstly:**

Many say that this matter is lie and commander of the faithful [AS] didn't have daughter named "Umm Kulthum.

**Secondly:**

It's said that "Umm Kulthum" was "Ali" [AS]'s stepdaughter. She was Abu-Bakr's daughter from "Asma bint Umais" and grew up in "Ali" [AS]'s house like "Muhammad bin Abu-Bakr"

**Thirdly:**

Some say that she was Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s daughter and they took her by force as it's written in the books "Kafi" and "Majma' al-Zawaed" from "Al-Haythami" and "Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir" from "Tabarani" and "Ali" [AS] didn't want to fight them.

**Question:**

Please tell us that how many years Imam "Mahdi" [AS] is going to live?

**Response:**

Ok, whenever you tell us that how old Hadrat "Khidr" [AS], Hadrat "Idris" [AS] and Hadrat "Jesus" [AS] are, then we'll tell you how old imam "Mahdi" [AS] is.

Of course it's clear that how old he is, because we know when he was born. The same god who has power to keep Hadrat "Jesus" alive about 2010 years and Hadrat "Khidr" [AS] more than 3 thousand years, that god can keep Imam "Mahdi" [AS] alive one thousand or two thousand years.

**Question:**

Different narratives have been said about the day of Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS]'s martyrdom, in your opinion which one of them are correct? Narratives which say she was martyred 75 days after prophet [PBUH] or narratives which say she was martyred 95 days after prophet [PBUH].

**Response:**

In my opinion as someone who is expert in "Rejal" science, narratives which say Hadrat "Fatimah" [AS] was martyred 95 days after prophet [PBUH] are more correct.

**Question:**

Amongst Sunni scholars, which one of them have said that Hadrat "Fatimah" is the best lady, better than all Muslim females?

**Response:**

It's quite clear. It's written in "Sahih Bukhari", v 4, p 209:

"فاطمة سيدة نساء أهل الجنة"

Fatimah is the lady of women in heaven.

"Hakim Nishaapuri", Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, v 3, p 151

Mr."Manawi"- who is amongst Sunni famous scholars- says in the book "Feiz al-Qadir", v 4, p 555:

"إن فاطمة أفضل من الخلفاء الأربعة بالإتفاق"

"Fatimah" was better than four caliphs, all Sunni scholars say so.











